Telephone +61 2 9265 9333 council@cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au GPO Box 1591 Sydney NSW 2001 cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au



16 May 2019

Our Ref: 2019/240628 File No: X020345

Mr Jim Betts Secretary NSW Department of Planning, Industry and Environment GPO Box 39 Sydney NSW 2001

By email: metrocbd@planning.nsw.gov.au Attn: Kate Masters kate.masters@planning.nsw.gov.au

Dear Mr Betts

Request for Gateway determination and delegation Planning Proposal - Public Exhibition – 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst – Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 Amendment

The Council of the City of Sydney on 13 May 2019, and the Central Sydney Planning Committee (CSPC) on 9 May 2019 resolved to approve a Planning Proposal for 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, for submission to the Department with a request for a Gateway Determination under Section 3.34 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979* (the Act).

Copies of Council and CSPC resolutions, committee reports and the Planning Proposal are enclosed.

The Planning Proposal has been prepared in accordance with Section 3.33 of the Act and the Department's guidelines 'A guide to preparing local environmental plans' and 'A guide to preparing planning proposals'.

The City requests a Gateway Determination on the Planning Proposal, in accordance with Section 3.34 of the Act.

The City also seeks authority to exercise the delegation of the Planning Secretary of all functions under section 3.36 of the Act to make the local environmental plan.

The City looks forward to working with you to progress this Planning Proposal for 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst.

Should you wish to speak to a council officer about any aspect of the Planning Proposal, please contact Matt Devine, Senior Specialist Planner Heritage on 9246 7846 or at

mdevine@cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au, or Sally Peters, Manager Central Sydney Planning on 9265 9465 or at speters@cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

K

Benjamin Pechey A/Executive Manager Strategic Planning and Urban Design

Encl.

- 1. Planning Proposal
- 2. CSPC Resolution, 9 May 2019
- 3. Council Resolution, 13 May 2019
- 4. Map, 7200_COM_HER_023_005_20190410
- 5. Report to Transport, Heritage & Planning Committee, 6 May 2019
- 6. Report to CSPC, 9 May 2019
- Information Relevant to Item 7, CSPC, 9 May 2019
 Information Relevant to Item 8.4 Council, 13 May 2019.

Planning Proposal – Proposed heritage item, 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

April 2019







City of Sydney Town Hall House 456 Kent Street Sydney NSW 2000

Contents

Introduction	2
Background	2
Part 1 – Objectives or intended outcomes	4
Part 2 – Explanation of the provisions	4
Part 3 – Justification	5
Part 4 – Mapping	. 11
Part 5 – Community consultation	. 12
Part 6 – Project timeline	12
Appendices	12

Introduction

This planning proposal explains the intent of, and justification for, the proposed amendment to Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (SLEP 2012). The amendment will identify one heritage item for inclusion in Schedule 5 located at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst.

The proposal has been prepared in accordance with Section 3.33 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (the Act) and the relevant Department of Planning guidelines, including 'A Guide to Preparing Local Environmental Plans' and 'A Guide to Preparing Planning Proposals'.

Background

Site identification

This planning proposal relates to the following place within Darlinghurst, as described in Part 3 and mapped in Part 5:

46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Lot 71 DP 602585

The property at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst is a single-storey timber weatherboard cottage, dating from circa 1876, and is privately owned.

Planning background

Weatherboard buildings are an important element to the City of Sydney's make up as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the City. These buildings contribute a unique character to their streets and a diversity to city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.

Following concerns about the number of applications for demolition or redevelopment of weatherboard buildings in its area, South Sydney City Council commissioned a study of this type of building in 2002. After the amalgamation with the City of Sydney in 2004, the City endorsed a number of heritage listings of weatherboard cottages, and soon after incorporated guidelines based on this study into the heritage provisions. These provisions remain in the City's current Development Control Plan 2012. These guide development, not only within Conservation Areas, but also specifically call out weatherboard buildings older than 50 years. Despite this there are fewer weatherboard buildings extant every year within the local government area as a result of development.

In mid-2018 the City of Sydney received a development application for a proposed development at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst involving the demolition of the existing single-storey weatherboard cottage and construction of a pair of two-storey semi-detached terraces. The timber weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, is located within the Paddington Conservation Area and identified as a contributory building. The City of Sydney commissioned a heritage assessment to determine if the site should be included as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (SLEP2012)

The independent heritage assessment by John Oultram Heritage + Design concluded that the cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst meets the threshold for inclusion as a heritage item on the SLEP 2012 for its historic values, rarity and

representativeness. The assessment notes that the cottage is an example of midlate Victorian weatherboard cottage that retains its early form and its detail to the front. The property contains the only remaining, timber weatherboard cottage from the earliest development of the Chisholm Estate.

The heritage assessment prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design is included at Appendix 1. A draft inventory sheet for this item is attached at Appendix 2.

This planning proposal is to include this item into Schedule 5 of Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

Study area and scope

The heritage study investigates the heritage significance of the property at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Road. This is shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1: Study area shaded yellow

Study findings

The heritage study report is included at **Appendix 1**. This study concludes that the site meets the threshold of heritage significance that warrants its potential listing as heritage items on Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

Assessment of significance for listing

The Heritage Council of NSW guideline outlines seven criteria of local heritage significance to determine whether an item warrants local listing. Only one of these seven criteria needs to be satisfied at the local level for local heritage listing.

Criteria (a) – An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criteria (f) – An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).

Criterion (g) – An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's:

Cultural or natural places; or

Cultural or natural environments

(Or a class of the local area's:

Cultural or natural places; or

Cultural or natural environments)

The proposed site satisfies these three Heritage Council criteria of local heritage significance for local listing.

Based on the above, progressing local heritage listing for the proposed heritage item will ensure the local heritage significance of this property is appropriately considered and maintained as part of future plans or redevelopment.

Part 1 – Objectives or intended outcomes

The objective of the planning proposal is to recognise and protect the heritage significance of this building, as identified in Part 2.

The intended outcomes to achieve these objectives are to:

• List the building at 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst as a heritage item in Schedule 5 of Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (SLEP2012).

Part 2 – Explanation of the provisions

Heritage schedule amendments

The planning proposal seeks to amend the SLEP 2012 Schedule 5 Environmental Heritage by inserting the following item as shown below in **Table 1.** Text to insert is shown as **bold underline**. Text to omit is shown as **bold strikethrough**.

Table 1 – Proposed amendments to Schedule 5, Environmental heritage, Part 1, heritage items

Locality	Item name	Address	Property description	Significance	ltem no.
Darlinghurst	Weatherboard cottage	<u>46</u> Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst	<u>Lot 71 DP</u> 602585	<u>Local</u>	<u>12292</u>

The heritage item naming convention conform to existing listings in Schedule 5. This is in accordance with the directions contained in the Standard Instrument (Local

Environmental Plans) Order 2006, which require the item name to briefly describe significant features.

The features noted in the above item names are described further in the supporting information contained in the heritage inventory included at **Appendix 2**. The non-statutory heritage inventory sheet can continue to be updated as new information becomes available, such as through completion of a conservation management plan.

Part 3 – Justification

Section A – Need for the planning proposal

Q1. Is the planning proposal a result of any strategic study or report?

Yes. The planning proposal is a result of a heritage assessment of the subject site, prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design completed in January 2019.

The item identified in this planning proposal is recommended for investigation for listing in this study, with a supporting draft heritage inventory sheet. This establishes that this recommended heritage item meets at least one of the Heritage Council criteria for local listing for its local heritage significance.

<u>Criteria (a) – An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).</u>

The independent heritage assessment prepared for the City notes:

46 Chisholm Street is a single storey, late Victorian cottage built c1876 for James Parker who had purchased Lot 7 in Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate. The Chisholm Estate (Roll Plan 619) appear to have been subdivided in 1875 and occupied an area bordered by South Dowling Street, Taylor Street, Flinders Street and Hannan Street...

The property was formerly part of Edward Riley's vast landholdings in the area that he purchased directly or later acquired, from John Palmer...

The cottage is emblematic of the early development of the area for small-scale housing.'

The building is of local significance.

<u>Criteria (f) – An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's</u> <u>cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area).</u>

The heritage assessment notes:

'The single storey, weatherboard cottage type is uncommon in the area that largely comprised two storey masonry terraces. In the plan of 1888... only five, one storey timber cottages are shown in the area and the subject cottage is now the only weatherboard house in the former Chisholm Estate subdivision and dates from the earliest building period for the area.

The subject building is rare locally, and therefore of local significance.

<u>Criterion (g) – An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's:</u>

Cultural or natural places; or

Cultural or natural environments

(Or a class of the local area's:

Cultural or natural places; or

Cultural or natural environments)

The heritage assessment notes:

'The house is an example of a mid Victorian weatherboard cottage that retains its early form and its detail to the front. The house retains a two room arrangement to the front and though it has been altered internally with the loss of much of its original, internal features it remains a representative example of the type.'

The building is a representative example of a mid-Victorian weatherboard cottage locally, and therefore of local significance.

The heritage assessment report is included in **Appendix 1**.

The draft heritage inventory sheet is included at Appendix 2.

Q2. Is the planning proposal the best means of achieving the objectives or intended outcomes, or is there a better way?

Yes. Appropriate heritage protection for this sites is best achieved through identification as a local heritage item in an environmental planning instrument.

City of Sydney has authorisation to make interim heritage orders for unlisted buildings under the *Heritage Act 1977*, however this item is included within an existing Conservation Area, preventing the City's ability to make an interim heritage order. A more strategic approach is preferred as recommended in this planning proposal.

Progressing local heritage listing for this proposed heritage item will ensure that the local heritage significance of this site is appropriately considered and maintained as part of future plans or redevelopment. It will also ensure prior formal consultation with the land owners and broader community. These outcomes are only achieved in the longer term through the proposed listing.

Section B – Relationship to strategic planning framework

Q3. Is the planning proposal consistent with the objectives and actions contained within the applicable regional or sub-regional strategy?

Yes. See comments below.

Greater Sydney Region Plan: A Metropolis of Three Cities

The Greater Sydney Region Plan, completed in March 2018, is the Greater Sydney Commission's vision for a Greater Sydney of three cities where most residents live within 30 minutes of their jobs and services. City of Sydney is situated within the Eastern Harbour City.

This plan sets a 40-year vision (to 2056) and establishes a 20-year plan to manage growth and change for Greater Sydney in the context of social, economic and environmental matters. This sets out how the State Government's 10 directions for a Greater Sydney are to be implemented through integrated planning. These 10 directions, with 40 supporting objectives, address infrastructure, liveability, productivity and sustainability. This planning proposal is consistent with these high level directions and objectives. In particular it addresses the liveability great places direction objective:

Objective 13: Environmental heritage is identified conserved and enhanced

By proposing to consult the community for listing this new heritage item, this planning proposal will fulfil this object.

Eastern City District Plan

The Eastern City District Plan completed by the Greater Sydney Commission in March 2018 is a 20-year plan to manage growth in the context of economic, social and environmental matters. The district plan identifies 22 planning priorities and associated actions that support a liveable, productive and sustainable future for the district. This planning proposal gives effect to the following key planning priority and actions:

Liveability Planning Priority E6 – Creating and renewing great places and local centres, and respecting the District's heritage

Action 26 - Identify, conserve and enhance environmental heritage by:

- (a) engaging with the community early in the planning process to understand heritage values and how they contribute to the significance of the place
- (b) applying adaptive re-use and interpreting heritage to foster distinctive local places
- (c) managing and monitoring the cumulative impact of development on the heritage values and character of places.

This priority seeks to enhance the district's liveability by identifying, conserving and enhancing the heritage place-makers in local centres and neighbourhoods. It notes that heritage buildings contribute to an area's sense of place, its distinctive character, and diversity of built form and uses, and bring people together. Conserved heritage buildings are some of the attributes of liveable great places acknowledged in this plan, which attracts residents, workers, visitors, enterprise and investment into centres.

In proposing to consult the community to identify this site of assessed local heritage significance, this planning proposal will address the district plan by encouraging the retention and continued use of these place-makers, as part of the distinctive identity of the City of Sydney.

Q4. Is the planning proposal consistent with council's local strategy or other local strategic plan?

Yes.

Sustainable Sydney 2030 Strategic Plan

The City's Sustainable Sydney 2030 Strategic Plan is the vision for the sustainable development of the City to 2030 and beyond. It includes 10 strategic directions to guide the future of the City, as well as 10 targets against which to measure progress. This planning proposal is consistent with the key directions of Sustainable Sydney 2030, particular Direction 7 for 'A Cultural and Creative City.

The planning proposal identifies 46 Chisholm Street as a heritage item, thereby providing for its conservation, a diversity of building stock in this vicinity and allowing future generations to understand the historic development of Darlinghurst. The listing will ensure future development considers and maintains the heritage significance of this site.

Q5. Is the planning proposal consistent with applicable State Environmental Planning Policies (SEPPs)?

Yes. The planning proposal is consistent with and does not contradict or hinder application of the following applicable State Environmental Planning Policies (SEPPs):

- SEPP No 1—Development Standards
- SEPP No 33—Hazardous and Offensive Development
- SEPP No 64—Advertising and Signage
- SEPP No 65—Design Quality of Residential Flat Development
- SEPP (Building Sustainability Index: BASIX) 2004
- SEPP (Educational Establishments and Child Care Facilities) 2017
- SEPP (Infrastructure) 2007
- SEPP (Miscellaneous Consent Provisions) 2007
- SEPP (State and Regional Development) 2011

The planning proposal is consistent with and does not contradict or hinder application of the following applicable with former Regional Environmental Plan (REP) for the Sydney and Greater Metropolitan Regions, which is deemed to have the weight of SEPPs:

Sydney REP (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005

Q6. Is the planning proposal consistent with applicable ministerial directions (s.117 directions)?

The planning proposal has been assessed against each Section 117 direction. The consistency of the planning proposal with these directions is shown in the table below.

No	Ministerial direction	Comment
1.1	Business and Industrial Zones	Not applicable
1.2	Rural Zones	Not applicable
1.3	Mining, Petroleum Production and Extractive Industries	Not applicable
1.4	Oyster Aquaculture	Not applicable
1.5	Rural Lands	Not applicable
2.1	Environment Protection Zones	Not applicable
2.2	Coastal Protection	Not applicable
2.3	Heritage Conservation	Consistent. This planning proposal provides for the conservation of a heritage item.

Table 2 – Consistency of the planning proposal with ministerial directions

No	Ministerial direction	Comment
2.4	Recreation Vehicle Areas	Not applicable
3.1	Residential Zones	Not applicable
3.2	Caravan Parks and Manufactured Home Estates	Not applicable
3.3	Home Occupations	Not applicable
3.4	Integrating Land Use and Transport	Consistent.
3.5	Development Near Licensed Aerodromes	Not applicable
3.6	Shooting Ranges	Not applicable
4.1	Acid Sulphate Soils	Consistent. This planning proposal does not contradict or hinder application of acid sulphate soils provisions in Sydney LEP 2012.
4.2	Mine Subsidence and Unstable Land	Not applicable
4.3	Flood Prone Land	Not applicable
4.4	Planning for Bushfire Protection	Not applicable
5.1	Implementation of Regional Strategies	Consistent. This planning proposal is consistent with key strategic goals and directions within the Greater Sydney Region Plan and the District as outlined above.
5.2	Sydney Drinking Water Catchments	Not applicable
5.3	Farmland of State and Regional Significance on the NSW Far North Coast	Not applicable
5.4	Commercial and Retail Development along the Pacific Highway, North Coast	Not applicable
5.8	Second Sydney Airport, Badgerys Creek	Not applicable
5.9	North West Rail Link Corridor Strategy	Not applicable
5.10	Implementation of Regional Plans	Consistent. As addressed above.

No	Ministerial direction	Comment
6.1	Approval and Referral Requirements	Consistent. This planning proposal does not include any concurrence, consultation or referral provisions nor does it identify any development as designated development.
6.2	Reserving Land for Public Purposes	Consistent. This planning proposal will not affect any land reserved for public purposes.
6.3	Site Specific Provisions	Consistent. This planning proposal does not introduce unnecessarily restrictive site specific controls.
7.1	Implementation of A Plan for Growing Sydney	Consistent. This planning proposal is consistent with this direction and does not hinder implementation of A Plan for Growing Sydney or the Greater Sydney Region Plan
7.2	Implementation of Greater Macarthur Land Release Investigation	Not applicable
7.3	Parramatta Road Corridor Urban Transformation Strategy	Not applicable
7.4	Implementation of North West Priority Growth Area Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan	Not applicable
7.5	Implementation of Greater Parramatta Priority Growth Area Interim Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan	Not applicable
7.6	Implementation of Wilton Priority Growth Area Interim Land Use and Infrastructure Implementation Plan	Not applicable

Section C – Environmental, social and economic impact

Q7. Is there any likelihood that critical habitat or threatened species, populations or ecological communities, or their habitats, will be adversely affected as a result of the proposal?

No. The planning proposal is unlikely to adversely affect any critical habitat or threatened species, populations or ecological communities or their habitats.

Q8. Are there any other likely environmental effects as a result of the planning proposal and how are they proposed to be managed?

No. It is unlikely that the proposed amendment to the heritage schedule of SLEP 2012 will result in development creating any environmental effects that cannot readily be controlled.

Q9. How has the planning proposal adequately addressed any social and economic effects?

Identification of this heritage item will facilitate retention of the building that may have significance to community. No changes to the zoning are proposed. The merit-based heritage provisions provide capacity for Council and any proponent to take into

account these matters when development is proposed. Listing may activate further conservation incentives for listed buildings.

Section D: State and Commonwealth interests

Q10. Is there adequate public infrastructure for the planning proposal?

Yes. The proposed property to be identified as a heritage item is well located in relation to existing public transport infrastructure, utility services, roads and essential services.

Q11. What are the views of State and Commonwealth public authorities consulted in the gateway determination?

The Heritage Council of NSW will be consulted during the public exhibition. The identification of this heritage item, based on a comprehensive heritage assessment, is consistent with Heritage Council standards.

It is not considered necessary to consult with other public authorities as the planning proposal relates to the listing of a local heritage item that is privately owned.

Local heritage listing will identify heritage impacts as a consideration if public works are proposed for the identified sites, however will not constrain Crown development.

Part 4 – Mapping

The heritage map tiles HER_023 will be updated to shade in brown the location of the new heritage item. The heritage map extract at **Figure 2** shows the new heritage item.



Figure 2: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, item 2292

Part 5 – Community consultation

Public Exhibition

The public authority consultation and exhibition process for the planning proposal will be subject to the conditions on the gateway determination issued by the Department of Planning and Industry. The consultation will take place in accordance with the gateway determination under section 3.34 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and the relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation 2000.

A 28-day public exhibition is recommended with notification:

- on the City of Sydney website;
- in newspapers that circulate widely in the City of Sydney Local Government Area; and
- in writing to the owner, the adjoining landowners, and the surrounding community in the immediate vicinity of the site.

Part 6 – Project timeline

The anticipated timeframe for the completion of the planning proposal is as follows:

Action	Anticipated date
Commencement / gateway determination	June 2019
Public exhibition & government agency consultation	July 2019
Consideration of submissions	August 2018 – September 2019
Post exhibition consideration of proposal	October 2019
Draft and finalise LEP	November 2019
LEP made (if delegated)	January 2019
Plan forwarded to DoPI for notification	January 2019

Table 3 – Anticipated timeframe for planning proposal

Appendices

- 1. Heritage Assessment
- 2. Draft Heritage Inventory Sheet

46 CHISHOLM STREET, DARLINGHURST, NSW

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT



Prepared by:

John Oultram Heritage & Design Level 2, 386 New South Head Road, Double Bay NSW 2028

T: (02) 9327 2748 E: heritagedesign@bigpond.com

Prepared for:

City of Sydney

March 2019

© John Oultram Heritage & Design

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	INTRODUC		3
	1.1	The Brief	3
	1.2	BACKGROUND	
	1.3	THE STUDY AREA	3
	1.4	Limitations and Terms	4
	1.5	SUPPORTING INFORMATION	
	1.6	METHODOLOGY	
	1.7	Authors and Acknowledgments	4
2.0	HISTORIC/	AL DEVELOPMENT	5
	2.1	Summary	
	2.2	46 Chisholm Street	7
3.0	PHYSICAL	DESCRIPTION	8
4.0	HERITAGE	LISTINGS & CONTROLS	15
	4.1	National Trust	15
	4.2	HERITAGE DIVISION OF THE NSW OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENT & HERITAGE	15
	4.2.1	State Heritage Register	15
	4.2.2	State Heritage Inventory	15
	4.3	LOCAL AUTHORITY	15
5.0	ASSESSME	NT OF SIGNIFICANCE	18
	5.1	Historic Significance	18
	5.1.1	Historical Associations	19
	5.2	Aesthetic Significance	19
	5.3	SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE	20
	5.4	TECHNICAL/SCIENTIFIC SIGNIFICANCE	
	5.5	RARITY	
	5.6	Representativeness	
	5.7	INTACTNESS	
	5.8	STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE	
	5.9	CONTRIBUTION TO THE PADDINGTON HERITAGE CONSERVATION AREA	21
6.0	SUMMARY	(AND RECOMMENDATIONS	22
	6.1	Summary	22
	6.2	Recommendations	
	6.2.1	Heritage Listing	22
	6.2.2	Conservation Area	23

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 THE BRIEF

The following report has been prepared to provide a heritage assessment of the existing property at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst NSW. The report has been prepared on behalf of the City of Sydney.

1.2 BACKGROUND

The property has been the subject of a development application (D/2018/591) to the City of Sydney that includes the demolition of the existing timber cottage on the site and its replacement with a two storey duplex.

The City of Sydney has requested a heritage assessment to consider if the property should be included as a heritage item in Schedule 5 Part 1 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

A draft heritage assessment was issued in January 2019 and, since, access to the interior has been made available. The assessment has been updated to include a more detailed description of the cottage (see Section 3.0).

1.3 THE STUDY AREA

The study area is Lot 71 in DP 602585 at Darlinghurst, Parish of Alexandria and County of Cumberland (Figure 1.1).



Figure 1.1 The Study Area shaded

Source: Six Maps

1.4 LIMITATIONS AND TERMS

The report only addresses the European significance of the place. The terms fabric, conservation, maintenance, preservation, restoration, reconstruction, adaptation, compatible use and cultural significance used in this report are as defined in the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter.

1.5 SUPPORTING INFORMATION

The development application was supported by a heritage impact statement:

Zoltan Kovacs Architect, Heritage Impact Assessment, Proposed Development, 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, date April 2018 (HIA)

1.6 METHODOLOGY

This report was prepared in accordance with the NSW Heritage Manual "Assessing Heritage Significance Guidelines" and the City of Sydney Council guidelines for the preparation of heritage impact statements. The philosophy adopted is that guided by the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter 2013.

1.7 AUTHORS AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report, including all diagrams and photographs, was prepared by John Oultram of John Oultram Heritage & Design, unless otherwise noted. Oultram Heritage & Design was established in 1998 and is on the NSW Heritage Office list of heritage consultants.

2.0 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT

2.1 SUMMARY

The HIA contained a detailed history of the site that is summarised below.

Date	Event
	The area was part of the land of the Cadigal people
1794	70 acres of land grated to John Palmer and later subdivided
1803	South Head Road (later Oxford Street) built
1811	Governor Macquarie sets aside 1000 acres of land east of the city as a water catchment to improve water supply
1816	First land grant to James Riley issued by Governor Macquarie
1855	Block of 8 acres purchased by James Chisholm
1880?	Lot 7 of Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate purchased by James Parker and subdivided
1881	Cottage constructed on the subject site and occupied by James Parker
1896	Property sold to James Brindle
	Later owners and occupiers are listed in the HIA

The site is part of the Chisholm Estate that appears to have been subdivided by Mary Chisholm c 1875¹.



Figure 2.1 Detail of Rygate and West's plan of Sydney c. 1888 Sheet 30

Source: City of Sydney Archives

¹ The Primary Application for 48 Chisholm Street (PA22494) notes Mary Chisholm as the owner in 1875



Figure 2.2 Metropolitan Detail Sheet Y1, dated 1897 showing the area largely developed

Source: State Library of NSW (Z/ M Ser. 4811.17/1)



Figure 2.3 Extract from same showing the cottage at 46 Chisholm Street

2.2 46 CHISHOLM STREET

Development in Chisholm Street is not listed in the Sands Directory till 1877 when ten houses appear.





Included in the street is 22 Chisholm Street with James Parker as occupier then noted as a *turner*. It is clear from later editions of the Sands that the street numbers altered as in 1880 Parker's address is noted as 30 Chisholm Street. By 1882 the address was altered to its current number of 46 Chisholm Street.





Sand Directories of 1880 (left) and 1882 (right). Note the neighbours to Parker's residence remain as Henry Bourne and John Western. Parker is noted in the 1879 Sands as collector.

It would appear from the above that the cottage was built c. 1876. By 1882 the majority of the sites to the east of Chisholm Street had been developed.

3.0 PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION

An inspection of the property was carried out by John Oultram in January. The interior of the cottage was inspected in March 2019 to ascertain its layout, condition and intactness from original construction. The description has been updated below and the current plan is shown in Figure 3.1.

46 Chisholm Street is a single storey, late Victorian cottage in the Georgian vernacular style set on a wide lot to the east side of the street. The house retains its original form and detail but has been modernised internally.

The house is in timber weatherboards (O) with a gabled, corrugated metal roof in short sheets (L). The original timber shingles (O) are extant under the later cladding. There is a verandah to the front with a skillion, corrugated metal roof supported on timber posts on metal stirrups (rebuilt). The verandah has no soffit lining. The cottage has a symmetrical front elevation with two pane, double hung, timber sashes (L) each side of a four panel, timber door and fanlight (Door L). Part of the original, timber internal lining is evident to the northern side of the front elevation where original boards have fallen away. There is a narrow skillion wing to the rear in chamfered timber weatherboards with a corrugated metal roof (L).

The cottage has a two room arrangement off a central hall that opens to a full width dining/living room and kitchen with a narrow hall to the bathroom in the rear skillion. The hall has a timber fretwork screen (L).

Floors are in polished timber (M) and tile (M). To the front walls are in masonite and battens (L) with moulded timber skirtings. To the hall and living room, walls are in plasterboard with moulded timber skirtings (M). Ceilings are in plasterboard with coved cornices (O). Doors are four panel timber with moulded timber architraves (M). Thee are multi-paned, glazed doors and sidelights to the living room (M). The front windows are two pane, double hung, timber sashes (L). There is a narrow, double hung sash to the bathroom (M). Fireplaces have been removed.

The cottage has a small garden to the front with concrete pavers and gravel and two, concrete planter boxes (all M). The garden is bounded by timber picket fence to the street (M).

The house has a paved garden to the rear with perimeter planter boxes and plantings and a small metal shed (all M). To the rear there is a two storey, late Victorian house at the rear fronting Sims Street.

Chisholm Street is a narrow street lined to the east with two storey, Victorian houses some in a terrace form. The western side of the street has the rear wings and garages to the properties fronting Flinders Street with some later infill development to the north. The street is part of a tightly knit pattern of streets and lanes bounded by Oxford Street, Flinders Street and South Dowling Street.

Figures 3.2 – 3.17



Figure 3.1 4

46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

Plan as existing

March 2019









Figure 3.2 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Front elevation

Figure 3.3 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Front elevation detail

Figure 3.4 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

View to interior linings where external board removed

Figure 3.5 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Verandah soffit







Figure 3.6 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Rear skillion

Figure 3.7 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

Hall

Figure 3.8 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

Front bedroom south showing typical wall and ceiling cladding



Figure 3.9 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Kitchen



Figure 3.10 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Living room



Figure 3.11 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Living room doors







Figure 3.12 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Bathroom

Figure 3.13 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

Roof – note the timber weatherboards to the north wall (right) and extant shingles

Figure 3.14 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Roof – note the extant shingles



Figure 3.15 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst View to the cottage from Sims Street



Figure 3.16 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Houses to the north



Figure 3.17 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst Terrace to the south

4.0 HERITAGE LISTINGS & CONTROLS

4.1 NATIONAL TRUST

The property is not classified on the Register of the National Trust of Australia (NSW).

4.2 HERITAGE DIVISION OF THE NSW OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENT & HERITAGE

4.2.1 State Heritage Register

Under the Heritage Act 1977 (as amended), the NSW Heritage Council, administered by the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage, maintains the State Heritage Register (SHR), a register of items and places that are considered to have heritage significance at a state level. The subject property is not listed on the Register.

4.2.2 State Heritage Inventory

The Heritage Division also compiles the State Heritage Inventory (SHI), a collated database of all places listed on statutory heritage lists, including Local Environmental Plans. The subject property is not listed on the Inventory.

4.3 LOCAL AUTHORITY

The local authority for the area is the City of Sydney. The property is not listed as a heritage item in Schedule 5 Part 1 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (as amended) (LEP) but is within the Paddington/Darlinghurst Heritage Conservation Area (C50).

The property is in the vicinity of a heritage item at:

REF	ADDRESS	ITEM	RANKING
1290	58A Flinders Street	Former Wesleyan School including interior	Local

The heritage provisions in the LEP relating to the development in a conservation area and in the vicinity of a heritage item would apply.

Development at the site would also be the subject of the Sydney Development Control Plan 2012 (as amended) (DCP) that contains detailed heritage objectives and controls for the development in conservation areas.

The property is identified as a Contributory Item on the Buildings Contributions Map for the area.



Figure 4.1

Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 – Heritage Maps HER_022 and HER_023

Heritage items are coloured brown



Figure 4.2 Sydney Development Control Plan 2012 – Building Contributions Map 023

Source: City of Sydney

5.0 ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The Heritage Office of New South Wales has issued guidelines as part of the NSW Heritage Manual regarding the assessment of heritage significance. The Manual is a well-regarded methodology for the assessment of cultural significance and is appropriate for application to the subject property.

5.1 HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE

Criterion (a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural
	history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

46 Chisholm Street is a single storey, late Victorian cottage built c.1876 for James Parker who had purchased Lot 7 in Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate. The Chisholm Estate (Roll Plan 619) appear to have been subdivided in 1875 and occupied an area bordered by South Dowling Street, Taylor Street, Flinders Street and Hannan Street. The early plan (undated) shows the subject site to its current configuration.





Extract from the subdivision of the Chisholm Estate. The subject site is lot 7 in Section 2

Source: NSW Land Registry Services DP192088

The property was formerly part of Edward Riley's vast landholdings in the area that he purchased directly, or later acquired, from John Palmer.

The cottage was sold to James Brindle c. 1895 and tenanted.

The cottage is emblematic of the early development of the area for small-scale housing.

Local Significance.

5.1.1 Historical Associations

Criterion (b)	An item has strong or special associations with the life or works of a
	person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural
	history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

The place is most closely associated with James Parker, variously a clerk, turner and collector. No biographical details were available.

The place is also associated with James Chisholm who carried out the early subdivision of one of the lots of the Riley Estate. The association would cover a large portion of the local area and is incidental.

Does not meet the criterion.

5.2 AESTHETIC SIGNIFICANCE

Criterion (c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a
	high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local
	area)

The house is a modest example of a single storey, late Victorian cottage in the Georgian vernacular style. The house retains its original form and detail to the front but has lost much of its original internal fabric with nearly all original finishes and detail replaced. The cottage may retain its original wall and roof framing and the current floors are in timber.





Footprint of the cottage c 1897 (left) and in 1978 (right). The northern rear wing has been demolished and the southern wing extended or rebuilt

The cottage is a little unusual being built on the original lot width (many other sites have been subdivided) and has a greater front setback as most house in the area are built to the street frontage.

The cottage is also unusual in the area for its weatherboard construction being the only such cottage in the triangular area bounded by Oxford Street, Flinders Street and South Dowling Street.

The house was built by James Parker as his own residence and this may account for both the lot layout and building material.

Does not meet the criteria.

5.3 SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE

Criterion (d)	The item has strong or special association with a particular community or
	cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social or spiritual reasons

The house has no special associations with any particular group.

Does not meet the criterion.

5.4 TECHNICAL/SCIENTIFIC SIGNIFICANCE

Criterion (e)	An item has the potential to yield information that will contribute to an
	understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or
	natural history of the local area)

There do not appear to have been any previous buildings on the site and the place has no archaeological potential.

The cottage demonstrates the timber weatherboard style of construction of the era but is of no technical significance.

Does not meet the criterion.

5.5 RARITY

Criterion (f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local
	area)

The single storey, weatherboard cottage type is uncommon in the area that largely comprised two storey, masonry terraces. In the plan of 1888 (Figure 2.1) only five, one storey timber cottage are shown in the area and the subject cottage is now the only weatherboard house in the former Chisholm Estate subdivision and dates from the earliest building period for the area.

Rare locally.

5.6 REPRESENTATIVENESS

Criterion (g)	An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's Cultural or natural places; or Cultural or natural environments
	(or a class of the local area's: Cultural or natural places; or Cultural or natural environments)

The house is an example of a mid Victorian weatherboard cottage that retains it early form and its detail to the front. The house retains a two room arrangement to the front and though It has been altered internally with the loss of much of its original, internal features it remains a representative example of the type.

Local Significance.

5.7 INTACTNESS

The cottage retains its primary form to the front and rear and its detail to the front but has been altered internally and much of the original fabric and detail removed. The southern rear wing has been rebuilt or extended and the northern rear wing demolished.

Intactness is not a measure of significance but the cottage retains part of its original layout to the front along with its external cladding, wall framing, possibly its internal cladding (under later coverings), the weatherboards to its gables (that clearly indicate the house was built prior to the adjoining houses), the timber roof structure and timber shingles (under the corrugated metal). The extant details clearly indicate its form of construction.

5.8 STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst has heritage significance at a local level for its historic value, its rarity and representation of the earliest development period of the Chisholm Estate.

The cottage is a single storey, late Victorian, weatherboard cottage in the Georgian vernacular style built c.1876 for James Parker who had purchased Lot 7 in Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate.

The property was part of the Chisholm Estate (Roll Plan 619) appear to have been subdivided in 1875 and occupied an area bordered by South Dowling Street, Taylor Street, Flinders Street and Hannan Street.

The cottage retains its primary form and some of its exterior detail. The cottage was only one of five, weatherboard cottages that were built in the area and is the last remaining weatherboard cottage on the Chisholm Estate subdivision.

5.9 CONTRIBUTION TO THE PADDINGTON HERITAGE CONSERVATION AREA

The cottage is unusual for this section of the Paddington HCA due to its scale and detail as most of the remaining, early houses on the Chisholm Estate are two storey and in masonry though there are some are single storey, masonry cottages. The cottage makes a very distinctive contribution to the conservation area and signals the earliest development of the area more clearly than other development that was built in the same period.
6.0 SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 SUMMARY

Based on the above we consider that the cottage at 46 Chisholm Street would meet three of the Heritage Manual criteria for identification as a place of local significance being:

Criterion (a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	
Criterion (f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)	
Criterion (g)	An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's Cultural or natural places; or Cultural or natural environments	
	(or a class of the local area's: Cultural or natural places; or Cultural or natural environments)	

The property is a surviving timber cottage that dates from the earliest development of the Chisholm Estate and that retains its primary form and detail to the front and that remains readable as an early development in the area. The cottage retains some of its early detail and fabric including external weatherboards, internal linings, wall structure, roof structure and timber shingles. The property contains the only remaining, timber weatherboard cottage from the earliest development of the Chisholm Estate.

6.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

6.2.1 Heritage Listing

This Heritage Assessment for the dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst was prepared by John Oultram Heritage & Design on behalf of the City of Sydney. The objective of the assessment was to determine if inclusion of the building as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (SLEP 2012) is warranted.

The assessment has determined that the item meets the threshold for inclusion for its historic values, rarity and representativeness. The following recommendations are made for consideration by the City of Sydney Council:

- The property at dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst should be considered for nomination for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (SLEP 2012)
- Consideration should be given to development principles that will ensure conservation of the building, as well as the retention of its contribution to the Paddington Heritage Conservation Area

6.2.2 Conservation Area

Council should investigate the possibility of creating a new Conservation Area focusing on the Chisholm Estate, as:

- The area has well defined boundaries
- The character of this area is quite distinct
- The narrow street pattern is also distinct due to the irregular major road pattern
- The area has a well-defined history and subdivision pattern
- The buildings pattern is more fine grained and tight knight than the pattern seen in other parts of the Paddington Heritage Conservation area to the east across South Dowling Street where the building stock is larger scale and includes two and three storey houses on larger sites and rows of terrace houses with verandahs

J. aman.

JOHN OULTRAM

7.0 APPENDIX A – WEATHERBOARD COTTAGES COMPARATIVE STUDY

7.1 PREAMBLE

Weatherboard buildings are an important element of the city as they are amongst the oldest residential buildings in the City. They contribute a unique character to their streets and bring diversity to city life. They also often signal the early development of Sydney's inner suburbs as areas were subdivided for residential development and also the common building methods of the time. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.

A heritage study of weatherboard cottages in the South Sydney LGA was prepared in 2004:

Musecape Pty Limited (in association), Draft South Sydney Weatherboard Buildings Survey Report, dated February 2004

The report was prepared in response to a perceived threat to weatherboard buildings in the south Sydney LGA. Over 300 weatherboard buildings were identified and of these, 270 were surveyed with many recommended for addition to the South Sydney LEP Schedule. Following amalgamation, the cottages are now within the City of Sydney LGA,

The report gives a good overview of the development of weatherboard and timber buildings in Sydney and the pattern of development in Sydney as larger landholdings and estates were subdivided for residential development including small-scale subdivision for workers' cottages. Timber was favoured by working class owners and builders as it was cheaper and easier to build.

Unfortunately, the use of timber has often led to substantial changes to, or demolition of, weatherboard cottages as the material was prone to white ant damage and rot and the houses were seen as less substantial than masonry buildings. They were also easier to alter.

7.2 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

The following schedule is a comparative study of selected weatherboard cottages in the Sydney Local Government Area (LGA) that are listed as heritage items or that are regarded as Contributory elements in a conservation area.

The cottages were chosen on the basis that they are listed items in the LEP or Contributory items in a conservation area and are comparable in scale (single storey), form, materials and detail. The schedule also provides the statements of significance for the properties to see what level of significance and intactness was the threshold for listing.

Common characteristic identified in the study below are

- Construction in the late Victorian period
- Modest scale and detail
- Double fronted form with hipped and gabled roofs
- Retention of the primary form and posted verandahs
- Some level of change and refurbishment internally
- Rear additions

The statements of significance often refer to the cottages as being **rare** and signalling the early development of the area.

7.3 46 CHISHOLM STREET

The cottage at 46 Chisholm Street has all of the characteristics noted in Section 7.2 above and remains readable as an early cottage in the conservation area.

It is rare being the only weatherboard cottage in the Chisholm Estate subdivision of the conservation area and is of a comparable standard and level of intactness to the properties noted in the Schedule.

7.4 934 ELIZABETH STREET, ZETLAND

Address	934 Elizabeth Street, Zetland
Date	Late Victorian
Description	A simple symmetrical single storey double fronted weatherboard cottage which has been vinyl clad. The building features timber double hung windows, posted verandah, cast iron lacework, 3 brick chimneys with corbelled collars and original chimney pots and an original 4 panelled front door.
History	Not known
Photos	
Plan	GROUND FLOOR
SHI	2420710
Significance	A good example of a late Victorian modest cottage and a rare example of an intact weatherboard cottage in the Zetland Estate which has retained its original form and detail.
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and extended to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its elevation (weatherboards overclad) and its posted verandah

7.5 117 HEREFORD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	117 Hereford Street, Forest Lodge			
Date	c. 1876			
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with			
	posed verandah to the front			
History	Built in 1876 and refurbished in 2008			
Photos				
Plan				
SHI	2427730			
Significance	A rare surviving weatherboard workers' cottage within the Glebe/Forest Lodge area			
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah			
	Torrit and defail to its from elevation and its posted verandari			

7.6 72 HORDERN STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	72 Hordern Street, Newtown (Rhoda Cottage)			
Date	c.1876			
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with			
	posted verandah to the front			
History	Part of O'Connell Town Village that was a subdivision of the land grant to William Bligh in 1803. First occupant recorded in 1879 was Joseph Collins			
Photos				
Plan				
SHI	2431153			
Significance	72 Hordern Street is of aesthetic and historical significance as a fine example of a single storey, simple, wide weatherboard cottage representing a class of dwellings now rare in Sydney generally. It is of aesthetic significance as part of a weatherboard group of buildings which contribute to the streetscape, with Nos. 74-76 Hordern Street adjacent			
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised (2004) but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah			

7.7 54 JENNINGS STREET, ALEXANDRIA

Address	54 Jennings Street, Alexandria			
Date	c. 1900			
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with			
	verandah to front Part of the Waterloo Estate of William Hutchinson's 1823 land Grant			
History	Part of the Waterloo Estate of William Hutchinson's 1823 land Grant			
Photos				
Plan				
SHI	2431156			
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a good example of a Federation			
	detached working class cottage associated with the adjacent early local industries and the Eveleigh Railway Workshops. It has high integrity as part of a			
	unique small group of weatherboard buildings in the area and for its own intact			
	form and detailing			
Notes	The cottage retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its			
	posted verandah			

7.8 46 LITTLE CLEVELAND STREET, REDFERN

Address	46 Little Cleveland Street, Redfern		
Date	c. early 1880s		
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with		
	posted verandah to the front		
History	Part of the Edward's Smith Hall's grant of 1822subdivided by Frederick Unwin in		
	1829. The house appears in the Sands Directory in 1884 occupied by Elizabeth		
	Patterson		
Photos			
Plan			
	Corrigation Corrigation Declaration 28:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 20:11 Be		
	STANLEY STREET		
SHI	2431155		
Significance	Of historical and aesthetic significance as an early working class cottage, rare due to its weatherboard construction and illustrating the variety of working class housing in the 19th century in this area. Due to its construction materials it appears to be one of the earliest houses in Little Cleveland Street		
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and appears to have a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah		

7.9 21 QUEEN STREET, BEACONSFIELD

Address	21 Queen Street, Beaconsfield (Beaufort)		
Date	Post 1895		
Description	Narrow, double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal		
	roof with posted verandah to the front		
History	Part of the Beaconsfield Estate		
Photos			
SHI	2431157		
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a relatively intact Federation weatherboard cottage which illustrates the variety of working class housing in this area, and demonstrates association between the provision of working class housing in the late 19th and early 20th century in this area and the proximity to industrial area operating at that time		
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah		

7.10 43 UNION STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	43 Union Street, Newtown (Wonga)			
Date	c. 1880s			
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with			
	later, posted verandah to the front			
History	First recorded in the Sands Directory in 1882 occupied by sawyer, Alexander			
	Storer			
Photos				
Plan				
SHI	2431148			
Significance	Wonga is of aesthetic significance as a late 19th century weatherboard cottage with elaborate details and finishes including a central tower section, a feature that rises from the edge of the front verandah about a metre with its own hipped end roof like a blind dormer. It has a well landscaped front garden and makes a positive contribution to the streetscape			
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a single storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and later detail to its front elevation including its posted verandah			

7.11 38 VICTORIA STREET, POTTS POINT

Address	38 Victoria Street, Potts Point (Overcliff)		
Date	c. 1868		
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with		
	posted verandah to the front		
History	Built by builder William Shoults and sold in 1869 to Master Mariner William Dawson		
	Mills		
Photos			
Plan			
	CER IN ANDROL BODOS B		
	HB OLON HB OLO		
SHI	2421379		
Significance	Overcliff Cottage is a rare surviving example of a single storey weatherboard cottage with a pyramidal roof or double hipped roof and is the only known remaining timber cottage in Potts Point. It is unusual in having height ceilings, quality cedar joinery, an elegant and finely detailed timber staircase leading to a room in the roof with excellent view of the harbour and Woolloomooloo Bay in particular. The cottage is enhanced by its setting on the edge of an escarpment overlooking the harbour and aesthetically makes a very important contribution to the streetscape		
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah		

7.12 39 MOREHEAD STREET, REDFERN

Address	39 Moorehead Street, Redfern			
Date	c. early 1870s			
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with posted verandah to the front			
History	Built on part of the 1822 land grant to Edward Hall Smith that became part of the Cooper Estate part of which was later subdivided by James Ewart. In 1873 the house was occupied by painter Henry Joseph Merer			
Photos				
Plan				
SHI	2421009			
Significance	39 Morehead Street is the last remaining timber house of a former group that was rare and significant at the State level as the only identified, surviving group of late 19th century timber, ridge line, working class rental houses built on small lots within a subdivision pattern that reflects the land management practises of the late 19th century 'urban manor' in a colonial environment. This significance is enhanced by the mid 20th century destruction of other comparable combinations of topographically responsive, urban vernacular built forms using predominantly timber fabric; 19th century Australian adapatations of English methods for providing cheap working class housing; clear links to the spread of industrialisation beyond the city boundaries in the 1870s and 1880s; and links to the pre-urban and pre-industrial rural land use of dairying. The Morehead Street timber houses group illustrated in its layers of fabric a continuum from rural to industrial to post-industrial cultural environments in the form of domestic housing unequalled elsewhere in the State. This building is also historically important as it forms part of the Cooper Street Conservation Area, an area which developed in the c1880s as a working class subdivision, as evidenced by the traditional grid patterns, small blocks and night soil lanes. The area is associated with Soloman Levey and Daniel Cooper, both emancipated convicts who became prominent businessmen forming the successful company Cooper and Levey. This timber dwelling is historically significant as it demonstrates the working class nature of the area through its construction and detail. The building has some landmark qualities being constructed on the property boundary and located on the prominent corner position of Morehead and Cooper Streets.			
Notes	The cottage appears very intact and retains its gabled form and rear skillion and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah			

7.13 2 WOOD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	2 Wood Street, Forest Lodge (Alpha)		
Date	c. 1880		
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage on a sandstone base with gabled, corrugated metal roof with verandah to the front on later brick piers		
History	Originally forming part of land purchased by John Wood in 1831, the property is Lot 28 in the subdivision of Wood's land undertaken in 1876. The cottage appears to have been erected around 1880 (the first in the street) for George Tumeth and stables were erected around 1885 for Johannes Theodore Joseph Brunning. Brunning named the cottage Alpha.		
Photos			
Plan	Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor		
SHI	Not listed – Contributory item in conservation area		
Significance	2 Wood Street is a modest example of a single storey, late Victorian cottage in		
	the Georgian vernacular style erected c. 1880 probably by the then owner of the property, George Tumuth and a brick stable built c. 1885 possibly by Johannes Brunning. The place has associations with John Wood (1811-1875) who erected the villa <i>Glenwood</i> on the early subdivision of the area and the Glebe that was set aside for the support of the Anglican Church in 1789. The house was the first built in the street is partly intact in form but has been altered internally and externally. The remnant brick stables are a rare, surviving example that demonstrates the early semi-commercial development of the area. The property is of high significance at a local level.		
Source	JOHD HIS May 2015		
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear yard but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation where the posted verandah has been reinstated (2015)		

Sydney

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

	AC Chiefe 1 an Otor A			
	46 Chisholm Street Planning: Sydney South Darlinghurst 2010 Planning: Sydney South			
	Darlinghurst 2010			
Local govt area: State:	Sydney Parish: NSW County:			
Other/former names:				
Area/group/complex:			Group ID:	
Aboriginal area:				
Curtilage/boundary:				
Item type:	Built	Group:	Category: House	
Owner:	Private - Individual			
Admin codes:		Code 2:	Code 3:	
Current use:	Dwelling house			
Former uses:	Dwelling house			
ssessed significance:	Local Endorsed significance: Local			
	² 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst has heritage significance at a local level for its historic value, its rarity and representation of the earliest development period of the Chisholm Estate.			
	The cottage is a single storey, late Victorian, weatherboard cottage in the Georgian vernacular style built c.1876 for James Parker who had purchased Lot 7 in Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate.			
	The property was part of the Chisholm Estate (Roll Plan 619) appear to have been subdivided in 1875 and occupied an area bordered by South Dowling Street, Taylor Street, Flinders Street and Hannan Street.			
The cottage retains its primary form and some of its exterior detail. The cottage was only on weatherboard cottages that were built in the area and is the last remaining weatherboard cotta Estate subdivision				
	The area was part of the land of the Cadigal people. In 1794 70 acres of land was granted to John Palmer and later subdivided. The first land grant to James Riley was issued by Governor Macquarie in 1816. In 1855 a Block of 8 acres of the subdivision of the Riley Estate was purchased by James Chisholm and the land subdivided c.1880 as the Chisholm Estate by Mary Chisholm. Lot 7 of Section 2 of the Chisholm Estate was purchased by James Parker and subdivided. A weatherboard cottage was constructed on the subject site c. 1876 and occupied by James Parker. In 1896 the property was sold to James Brindle.			
Themes:	National theme 4. Settlement	State theme Accommodat	Local theme	
	4. Settlement	Towns, subur	bs and villages	
Designer:				
Designer: Builder:				

Sydney

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

Physical description: 46 Chisholm Street is a single storey, late Victorian cottage in the Georgian vernacular style set on a wide lot to the east side of the street. The house retains its original form and detail but has been modernised internally.

The house is in timber weatherboards (O) with a gabled, corrugated metal roof in short sheets (L). The original timber shingles (O) are extant under the later cladding. There is a verandah to the front with a skillion, corrugated metal roof supported on timber posts on metal stirrups (rebuilt). The verandah has no soffit lining. The cottage has a symmetrical front elevation with two pane, double hung, timber sashes (L) each side of a four panel, timber door and fanlight (Door L). Part of the original, timber internal lining is evident to the northern side of the front elevation where original boards have fallen away. There is a narrow skillion wing to the rear in chamfered timber weatherboards with a corrugated metal roof (L).

The cottage has a two room arrangement off a central hall that opens to a full width dining/living room and kitchen with a narrow hall to the bathroom in the rear skillion. The hall has a timber fretwork screen (L).

Floors are in polished timber (M) and tile (M). To the front walls are in masonite and battens (L) with moulded timber skirtings. To the hall and living room, walls are in plasterboard with moulded timber skirtings (M). Ceilings are in plasterboard with coved cornices (O). Doors are four panel timber with moulded timber architraves (M). Thee are multi-paned, glazed doors and sidelights to the living room (M). The front windows are two pane, double hung, timber sashes (L). There is a narrow, double hung sash to the bathroom (M). Fireplaces have been removed.

The cottage has a small garden to the front with concrete pavers and gravel and two, concrete planter boxes (all M). The garden is bounded by timber picket fence to the street (M).

The house has a paved garden to the rear with perimeter planter boxes and plantings and a small metal shed (all M). To the rear there is a two storey, late Victorian house at the rear fronting Sims Street.

Chisholm Street is a narrow street lined to the east with two storey, Victorian houses some in a terrace form. The western side of the street has the rear wings and garages to the properties fronting Flinders Street with some later infill development to the north. The street is part of a tightly knit pattern of streets and lanes bounded by Oxford Street, Flinders Street and South Dowling Street.

- O ORIGINAL
- L LATER
- M MODERN

Physical condition Good level:

Physical condition: Later alterations, some fabric removed or overload with later materials
Archaeological Little
potential level:
Archaeological
potential Detail:
Modification dates:
Recommended The building should be retained and conserved. A Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Statement, or a management: Conservation Management Plan, should be prepared for the building prior to any major works being undertained.

management: Conservation Management Plan, should be prepared for the building prior to any major works being undertaken. There shall be no vertical additions to the building and no alterations to the façade of the building other than to reinstate original features. The principal room layout and planning configuration as well as significant internal original features including ceilings, cornices, joinery, flooring and fireplaces should be retained and conserved. Any additions and alterations should be confined to the rear in areas of less significance, should not be visibly prominent and shall be in accordance with the relevant planning controls

Management: Management category Management name

SHI number 5066915 Study number

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

Sydney

Further comments:						
Criteria a): [Historical significance]						
Criteria b): [Historical association significance]						
Criteria c): [Aesthetic/ Technical significance]						
Criteria d): [Social/Cultural significance]						
Criteria e): [Research significance]						
Criteria f): [Rarity]	masonry terrace the subject cotta	es. In the plan of 1888	ge type is uncommon in the g (Figure 2.1) only five, one seatherboard house in the form the area.	storey timber cotta	ge are shown in the	e area and
	Rare locally.					
Criteria g):	The house is an		torian weatherboard cottage	-		
[Representative]			rrangement to the front and t atures it remains a represent	-	-	vith the
Intactness/Integrity:	The cottage retain and much of the northern rear with original layout to later coverings),	ins its primary form to original fabric and define ing demolished. Intaction the front along with it the weatherboards to it per roof structure and the	the front and rear and its de tail removed. The southern re- ness is not a measure of sign its external cladding, wall fra- its gables (that clearly indica- imber shingles (under the co-	tail to the front but ear wing has been ificance but the co aming, possibly its te the house was b	has been altered in rebuilt or extended ttage retains part of internal cladding (uilt prior to the adju	and the f its under oining
References:		eritage & Design	Title 46 Chisholm Street, Darlin Heritage Impact Assessme		•	Year 2019 2018
Studies:	Author	Title			Number	Year
Parcels:	Parcel code LOT	Lot number 71	Section number	Plan code DP	Plan number 602585	

Sydney

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

Latitude:					Longitude:		
Location validity:					Spatial accuracy:		
Map name:		Map scale:					
AMG zone:			Eas	ting:		Northing:	
Listing:	Name	,	Title			Number	ListingDate
Data entry:	Data first entered:	05/04/2019		Data updated:	08/04/2019	Sta	tus: Completed

Date: 08/04/2019 Full report
This report was produced using the State Heritage Inventory application provided by the Heritage Division, Office of Environment and Heritage

SHI number 5066915 Study number

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

Image:



Caption: 46 Chisholm Street Front Elevation

Copy right: Image by: Image date:

y: John Oultram Heritage & Design te: 01/03/2019

Image number:

Image url: http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/3454d188a47586c48f4b095a9fecb7ac72a.jpg

Thumbnail url: http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/Thumb_test3454d188a47586c48f4b095a9fecb7ac72a.jpg

Image:



Caption: Detail of Rygate and West's plan of Sydney c. 1888 Sheet 30 Copy right:

Sydney

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

Image by:	Rygate and West
Image date:	
Image number:	
Image url:	http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/345bb9e9f02de3e4313909cbe037fd154e1.jpg
Thumbnail url:	http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/Thumb_test345bb9e9f02de3e4313909cbe037fd154e1.jpg
Image:	

M HO L 30 361 38 40 H 42 44 48 46 50 52 5A 56 58

L	CHISHOLM
Caption:	Metropolitan Detail Sheet Y1, dated 1897
Copy right:	
Image by:	
Image date:	
Image number:	
Image url:	http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/3456bb5cfbefb12412692142d0b57d4a5b4.jpg
Thumbnail url:	http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP P/Thumb_test3456bb5cfbefb12412692142d0b57d4a5b4.jpg
Image:	

SHI number 5066915 Study number

Item name: Weatherboard Cottage

Location: 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst 2010

-5 cИ 0 m

Caption: Plan as existing

Copy right: Image by: John Oultram Heritage & Design Image date: 01/03/2019

Image number:

Image url:http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP
P/345ea6282c272ba4642a1de1f544acdee7f.jpgThumbnail url:http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/maritimeheritageapp/resources/Heritage/shi/WebAP



Resolution of Central Sydney Planning Committee

9 May 2019

Item 7

Public Exhibition - Planning Proposal - 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 Amendment

Moved by the Chair (the Lord Mayor), seconded by Councillor Thalis -

It is resolved that:

- (A) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for Gateway Determination;
- (B) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) the Central Sydney Planning Committee note the recommendation to Council's Transport Heritage and Planning Committee on 6 May 2019 that Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst;
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination; and
- (E) the Central Sydney Planning Committee note the information in 'Appendix A -Weatherboard Cottages Comparative Study' prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design at Attachment B to the Information Relevant To Item 7 for the Central Sydney Planning Committee on 9 May 2019 and incorporate it as an appendix to the supporting Heritage Assessment report of the 'Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst' at Attachment A to the subject report.

Carried unanimously.

X020345

EOFSYDNEY

Resolution of Council

13 May 2019

Item 8.4

Public Exhibition - Planning Proposal - 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst – Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 Amendment

It is resolved that:

- (A) Council approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for a Gateway Determination;
- (B) Council approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst;
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination; and
- (E) Council note the information in 'Appendix A Weatherboard Cottages Comparative Study' prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design at Attachment B to the Information Relevant To Item 8.4 Council on 13 May 2019 and incorporate it as an appendix to the supporting Heritage Assessment report of the 'Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst' at Attachment A to the subject report.

The motion was carried on the following show of hands -

Ayes (6) The Lord Mayor, Councillors Kok, Miller, Scott, Scully and Thalis.

Noes (4) Councillors Chung, Forster, Phelps and Vithoulkas.

Motion carried.

X020345





Item 4.

Planning Proposal - Public Exhibition – 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst – Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 Amendment

File No: X020345

Summary

Weatherboard buildings are an important element to the City's make up as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the city. These buildings contribute a unique character to their streets, and a diversity in city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare, and have been under threat of demolition.

In 2002, concerns about the increasing number of applications for demolition or redevelopment of weatherboard buildings in its area, South Sydney City Council commissioned a study of this type of building. Following the amalgamation in 2004, the City endorsed a number of heritage listings of weatherboard cottages, and soon after incorporated guidelines based on this study into heritage provisions. These provisions remain in the City's current Development Control Plan 2012. These guide development not only generally within conservation areas but also specifically in relation to weatherboard buildings older than 50 years.

In mid-2018, the City of Sydney received a development application for a proposed development at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, involving the demolition of the existing cottage and construction of a pair of two-storey semi-detached terraces. The timber weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, is located within the Paddington Conservation Area and identified as a contributory building. The City commissioned an independent heritage assessment to determine if the site should be included as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

The independent heritage assessment by John Oultram Heritage + Design concluded the cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst meets the threshold for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 for its historic values, rarity and representativeness. The assessment notes that the house is an example of a mid-late Victorian weatherboard cottage that retains its early form and its detail to the front. The property contains the only remaining, timber weatherboard cottage from the earliest development of the Chisholm Estate.

This report seeks support for listing the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 to ensure its heritage significance is protected. The City has prepared a Planning Proposal to include the site as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

Recommendation

It is resolved that:

- (A) Council approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for a Gateway Determination;
- (B) Council approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst; and
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination.

Attachments

- Attachment A. Planning Proposal Proposed Heritage Item, 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst
- Attachment B. Heritage Assessment
- Attachment C. Draft Heritage Inventory Sheet

Background

- 1. Weatherboard buildings are an important element to the City's make up as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the city and demonstrate particular aspects of 19th and early 20th century life. Although once common, they are now rare due to successive periods of redevelopment. These buildings contribute a unique character to their streets, and a diversity in housing stock and city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare, and continue to be under threat of demolition.
- 2. Following concerns about the increasing number of applications for demolition or redevelopment of weatherboard buildings in its area, South Sydney City Council commissioned a study of this type of building in 2002.
- 3. After the amalgamation with the City of Sydney in 2004, the City endorsed a number of heritage listings of weatherboard cottages, as recommended by this study.
- 4. Soon after, the City incorporated guidelines related to this study into the Heritage Development Control Plan 2006, which has evolved into the current Sydney Development Control Plan 2012. This document guides development of weatherboard cottages within Conservation areas, but also specifically any weatherboard buildings older than 50 years.
- 5. In mid-2018, the City of Sydney received a development application for a proposal at 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst, involving the demolition of the existing single-storey weatherboard cottage, and construction of a pair of two-storey semi-detached terraces. The application triggered a site inspection.
- 6. The City commissioned an independent heritage assessment to determine if the single-storey weatherboard cottage should be included as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.
- 7. The heritage assessment by John Oultram Heritage + Design determined the dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst meets the threshold for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 for its historic values, rarity and representativeness. The heritage assessment is at Attachment B of this report, and is supported by the Draft Inventory Sheet at Attachment C.
- 8. The development application has been refused by the City on the basis of heritage and adverse internal amenity impacts, along with impacts to the streetscape. The application has been through a formal review process, which upheld the refusal determination.
- 9. The proponent of the development has appealed to the Land and Environment Court regarding the determination.
- 10. The subject site was not identified in the South Sydney City Council Weatherboard Buildings Study, however, this study was not comprehensive. As has been identified in the independent heritage assessment, the dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst is rare in its context, as the only weatherboard cottage in its immediate vicinity and is one of a very limited number in Darlinghurst generally.
- 11. This report seeks support for public exhibition of a planning proposal for listing the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 to ensure its heritage significance is protected.

12. The City has prepared a Planning Proposal to include the site as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012, which is provided at Attachment A.

Key Implications

Strategic Alignment - Sustainable Sydney 2030 Vision

- 13. Sustainable Sydney 2030 is a vision for the sustainable development of the City to 2030 and beyond. It includes 10 strategic directions to guide the future of the City, as well as 10 targets against which to measure progress. This plan is aligned with the following strategic directions and objectives:
 - (a) Direction 7 A Cultural and Creative City the planning proposal supports the cultural life and diversity of Sydney through the retention of a historic dwelling.
 - (b) Direction 9 Sustainable Development, Renewal and Design retention of historic buildings contributes to this Direction.

Relevant Legislation

- 14. Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979.
- 15. Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulations 2000.

Public Consultation

- 16. If Council approves the planning proposal, it will be forwarded to the Department of Planning and Industry with a request for a Gateway Determination to allow public exhibition.
- 17. The public exhibition process for the planning proposal will be subject to the conditions of the Gateway Determination issued by the Department of Planning and Industry.
- 18. The City will notify the public of the exhibition of the planning proposal on the City's website, in newspapers that circulate in the area and in writing to the land owners, relevant community groups and stakeholders. Exhibition documents will be made available for viewing on the City of Sydney website, the relevant neighbourhood service centre and one stop shop.

GRAHAM JAHN, AM

Director City Planning, Development and Transport

Matt Devine, Senior Specialist Planner (Heritage)

Item 7.

Public Exhibition - Planning Proposal - 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 Amendment

File No: X020345

Summary

Weatherboard buildings are an important element to the City's make up as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the city. These buildings contribute a unique character to their streets, and a diversity in city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare, and have been under threat of demolition.

In 2002, concerns about the increasing number of applications for demolition or redevelopment of weatherboard buildings in its area, South Sydney City Council commissioned a study of this type of building. Following the amalgamation in 2004, the City endorsed a number of heritage listings of weatherboard cottages, and soon after incorporated guidelines based on this study into heritage provisions. These provisions remain in the City's current Development Control Plan 2012. These guide development not only generally within conservation areas but also specifically in relation to weatherboard buildings older than 50 years.

In mid-2018, the City of Sydney received a development application for a proposed development at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, involving the demolition of the existing cottage and construction of a pair of two-storey semi-detached terraces. The timber weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, is located within the Paddington Conservation Area and identified as a contributory building. The City commissioned an independent heritage assessment to determine if the site should be included as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

The independent heritage assessment by John Oultram Heritage + Design concluded the cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst meets the threshold for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 for its historic values, rarity and representativeness. The assessment notes that the house is an example of a mid-late Victorian weatherboard cottage that retains its early form and its detail to the front. The property contains the only remaining, timber weatherboard cottage from the earliest development of the Chisholm Estate.

This report seeks support for listing the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 to ensure its heritage significance is protected. The City has prepared a Planning Proposal to include the site as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

Recommendation

It is resolved that:

- (A) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for Gateway Determination;
- (B) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) the Central Sydney Planning Committee note the recommendation to Council's Transport Heritage and Planning Committee on 6 May 2019 that Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst; and
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination.

Attachments

- Attachment A. Planning Proposal Proposed Heritage Item 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst
- Attachment B. Heritage Assessment
- Attachment C. Draft Inventory Sheet

Background

- 1. Weatherboard buildings are an important element to the City's make up as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the city and demonstrate particular aspects of 19th and early 20th century life. Although once common, they are now rare due to successive periods of redevelopment. These buildings contribute a unique character to their streets, and a diversity in housing stock and city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare, and continue to be under threat of demolition.
- 2. Following concerns about the increasing number of applications for demolition or redevelopment of weatherboard buildings in its area, South Sydney City Council commissioned a study of this type of building in 2002.
- 3. After the amalgamation with the City of Sydney in 2004, the City endorsed a number of heritage listings of weatherboard cottages, as recommended by this study.
- 4. Soon after, the City incorporated guidelines related to this study into the Heritage Development Control Plan 2006, which has evolved into the current Sydney Development Control Plan 2012. This document guides development of weatherboard cottages within Conservation areas, but also specifically any weatherboard buildings older than 50 years.
- 5. In mid-2018, the City of Sydney received a development application for a proposal at 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst, involving the demolition of the existing single-storey weatherboard cottage, and construction of a pair of two-storey semi-detached terraces. The application triggered a site inspection.
- 6. The City commissioned an independent heritage assessment to determine if the single-storey weatherboard cottage should be included as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.
- 7. The heritage assessment by John Oultram Heritage + Design determined the dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst meets the threshold for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 for its historic values, rarity and representativeness. The heritage assessment is at Attachment B of this report, and is supported by the Draft Inventory Sheet at Attachment C.
- 8. The development application has been refused by the City on the basis of heritage and adverse internal amenity impacts, along with impacts to the streetscape. The application has been through a formal review process, which upheld the refusal determination.
- 9. The proponent of the development has appealed to the Land and Environment Court regarding the determination.
- 10. The subject site was not identified in the South Sydney City Council Weatherboard Buildings Study, however, this study was not comprehensive. As has been identified in the independent heritage assessment, the dwelling at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst is rare in its context, as the only weatherboard cottage in its immediate vicinity and is one of a very limited number in Darlinghurst generally.
- 11. This report seeks support for public exhibition of a planning proposal for listing the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 to ensure its heritage significance is protected.

12. The City has prepared a Planning Proposal to include the site as a heritage item within Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012, which is provided at Attachment A.

Key Implications

Strategic Alignment - Sustainable Sydney 2030 Vision

- 13. Sustainable Sydney 2030 is a vision for the sustainable development of the City to 2030 and beyond. It includes 10 strategic directions to guide the future of the City, as well as 10 targets against which to measure progress. This [choose an item] is aligned with the following strategic directions and objectives:
 - (a) Direction 7 A Cultural and Creative City the planning proposal supports the cultural life and diversity of Sydney through the retention of a historic dwelling.
 - (b) Direction 9 Sustainable Development, Renewal and Design retention of historic buildings contributes to this Direction.

Relevant Legislation

- 14. Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979
- 15. Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulations 2000

Public Consultation

- 16. If the Central Sydney Planning Committee and Council approve the planning proposal, it will be forwarded to the Department of Planning and Industry with a request for a Gateway Determination to allow public exhibition.
- 17. The public exhibition process for the planning proposal will be subject to the conditions of the Gateway Determination issued by the Department of Planning and Industry.
- 18. The City will notify the public of the exhibition of the planning proposal on the City's website, in newspapers that circulate in the area and in writing to the land owners, relevant community groups and stakeholders. Exhibition documents will be made available for viewing on the City of Sydney website, the relevant neighbourhood service centre and one stop shop

GRAHAM JAHN, AM

Director City Planning, Development and Transport

Matt Devine, Senior Specialist Planner (Heritage)

Relevant Information for Central Sydney Planning Committee

FILE:	X020345	DATE:	9 May 2019	
TO:	The Central Sydney Planning Committee			
FROM:	Graham Jahn, Director City Planning, Development and Transport			
SUBJECT:	Information Relevant To Item 7 – Planning Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Loo Amendment	•		

Alternative Recommendation

It is resolved that:

- (A) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for Gateway Determination;
- (B) the Central Sydney Planning Committee approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) the Central Sydney Planning Committee note the recommendation to Council's Transport Heritage and Planning Committee on 6 May 2019 that Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst; and
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination.

 (E) the Central Sydney Planning Committee note the information in 'Appendix A -Weatherboard Cottages Comparative Study' prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design at Attachment B to the Information Relevant To Item 7 for the Central Sydney Planning Committee on 9 May 2019 and incorporate it as an appendix to the supporting Heritage Assessment report of the 'Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst' at Attachment A to the subject report.

Additions shown in **bold italics.**

Background

At the meeting of the Transport, Planning and Heritage Committee on 6 May 2019, further information was requested regarding Item 7: Planning Proposal 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

The site has been the focus of redevelopment discussions since late 2017, when the property owner met City staff for a Pre-DA meeting. On that occasion, and subsequently, the City has consistently stated it did not support the proposed demolition of the existing cottage or subdivision of the site. On at least two occasions, City staff offered to work with the applicant on alternatives to wholesale demolition.

A chronology of the planning process for the proposed development is as follows:

- 12 December 2017 Pre-DA Meeting and site inspection
- 13 December 2017 the City advised that the demolition of the weatherboard cottage is not supported nor the subdivision of the land or the erection of two semi-detached dwellings. The pre-DA advice is provided at Attachment A.
- 30 May 2018 Development application lodged, D/2018/591, proposing the demolition of the existing single dwelling and subdivision of the site into two titles and the construction of two, two storey terraces.
- 28 August 2018 the City sought an interim heritage order from the Office of Environment and Heritage.
- 19 September 2018 Proponent requested to withdraw the development application as the City is likely to refuse the development application. Proponent did not withdraw the development application.
- 21 September 2018 The development application was refused under delegated authority.
- 16 November 2018 City engages John Oultram Heritage & Design to assess heritage significance.
- 12 December 2018 A section 8.2(1)(a) review of determination application was lodged.
- 21 December 2018 The Office of Environment and Heritage advised they were not pursuing an interim heritage order as development application had been refused, the property was not under threat, and there was time to complete an independent heritage assessment.

- 1 March 2019 Site inspection with Council staff and heritage consultant.
- 12 March 2019 Final heritage report notes that property should be considered for nomination for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environment Plan 2012
- 14 March 2019 Section 8.2(1)(a) application was refused.
- 18 March 2019 Applicant lodged Class 1 appeal with Land & Environment Court

The appeal is set for a conciliation conference on 18 November 2019. Council filed its Statement of Facts and Contentions on 3 May 2019. Key contentions include:

- Heritage impact The application includes demolition of a contributory building, without demonstrating why the cottage is not capable of retention, nor does it justify demolition.
- Subdivision The proposed subdivision would result in two lots with street widths of 3.047m and 3.007m, which is disproportionately narrow in the streetscape, disrupting the rhythm within the terrace row. The resulting dwellings will have internal widths of 2.6m with 0.8m hallways, which are not considered functional.
- Residential amenity The proposed dwellings provide less than 50% of the required private open space, with no solar access to the rear private open space or either dwelling.
- Design excellence The proposal does not exhibit design excellence in relation to materials, streetscape, bulk and massing, residential amenity, subdivision pattern, building width and façade design.
- Public interest The proposal is detrimental to the conservation area and locality and submissions were also received objecting to the proposal on the grounds of heritage conservation, overdevelopment and poor internal amenity.

Comparative Analysis

Additional information has been provided by John Oultram Heritage + Design, further detailing the comparative analysis of weatherboard cottages within the City of Sydney. This information is provided in Attachment B and recommended to be incorporated into the Planning Proposal.

The cottage at 46 Chisholm Street has all of the characteristics of heritage listed weatherboard cottages in the City with a comparable degree of significance and intactness. It remains readable as an early cottage in the conservation area and is the only weatherboard cottage in the Chisholm Estate subdivision.

Weatherboard buildings are an important element of the city as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the City. They contribute a unique character to their streets and a diversity to city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.
While the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street is flanked by two storey masonry terraces, the predominant building type of the Paddington Conservation Area, this does not mean the better heritage outcome is demolition and construction of two, two-storey terrace buildings.

Impact of Heritage Listing

The proposed heritage listing does not preclude appropriate development occurring at the site. For example, this may include the addition of a small wing at the rear, or an attic conversion. Staff have offered to work with the applicant on alternatives to the proposed wholesale demolition on at least two occasions, being in the pre-DA advice and when suggesting the development application be withdrawn or be refused.

The proposed listing of the weatherboard cottage is a separate matter to the development application matter to be heard by the Land and Environment court.

Prepared by: Matt Devine, Senior Specialist Planner (Heritage)

Attachments

Attachment A. Pre-DA Advice - Redacted Email dated 13 December 2017

Attachment B. Heritage Assessment - Appendix- Weatherboard Cottage Comparative Analysis

Approved

GRAHAM JAHN AM

Director City Planning, Development and Transport

Attachment A

Pre-DA advice - redacted email dated 13 December 2017

From:	
То:	
Cc:	;
Subject:	RE: Pre-DA submission - 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst
Date:	Wednesday, 13 December 2017 3:46:00 PM
Attachments:	image001.jpg

Dear

Thank you for organising and meeting with the City yesterday at your clients home at 46 Chisolm Street, Darlinghurst.

As discussed with you on site yesterday, the City has had the opportunity now after the site visit to further review the preliminary documentation provided.

The proposal for the demolition of the weatherboard cottage is not supported and, in turn, nor is the subdivision of the land or the erection of two semi-detached dwellings.

Notwithstanding, the City would like to work with you and your client in regards to the scope of change that may be possible. It may be possible, for instance, to go into the roof space to create more habitable area via a rear roof extention and potentially new dormer(s) to the front. It may also be possible to move the ground floor back wall marginally.

I trust that this information is of assistance.

Regards,



Hi and

A pre-DA request is attached.

The proposal is for:

- demolition of the existing single storey weather board cottage;
- subdivide the land into 2 even Torrens title lots; and
- erect 2 to 2-storey semi-detached dwelling houses.

Draft plans prepared by dated 22/11/17, Draft Heritage Impact	
Statement (HIS) prepared by dated 25/11/17 and a Review are	
provided attached.	

The new housing proposed is on small lots and our view is that the 'fine grain' and form or this Conservaiton is actually reinforced by the proposal. We are aware that the City of Sydney officers have taken quite an enlightened view in respect to small lot housing such as in the case of the recommendation for (see DA) and we are hoping for a similarly enlightened view.

Let's talk, the client and architect would like to meet at your earliest convenience and please call if you want to do a full site visit to organise.

Regards

	1	
Postal Address:		
Office Address: Phone: +61.2	Fax: +61.2	
Please consider the	e environment before printing this e-mail.	
-		

Disclaimer: This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the following recipient(s):

,council@cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au,

If you are not any of the named addressee mentioned above; you should not disseminate, distribute, copy or alter this e-mail. Please notify Philip Bull immediately by replying to this e-mail if you have received this e-mail by mistake and delete this e-mail from your system.

Any views or opinions presented in this e-mail are solely those of the author and might not represent those of BBC Consulting Planners. BBC Consulting Planners accepts no liability for the content of this email, or for the consequences of any actions taken on the basis of the information provided, unless that information is subsequently confirmed in writing.

Warning: Although Planners has taken reasonable precautions to ensure no viruses are present in this email, Planners cannot accept responsibility for any loss or damage arising from the use of this email or attachments.

The original e-mail was sent on 1/12/2017 at 11:21 AM

Attachment B

Heritage Assessment - Appendix - 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

7.0 APPENDIX A – WEATHERBOARD COTTAGES COMPARATIVE STUDY

7.1 PREAMBLE

Weatherboard buildings are an important element of the city as they are amongst the oldest residential buildings in the City. They contribute a unique character to their streets and bring diversity to city life. They also often signal the early development of Sydney's inner suburbs as areas were subdivided for residential development and also the common building methods of the time. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.

A heritage study of weatherboard cottages in the South Sydney LGA was prepared in 2004:

Musecape Pty Limited (in association), Draft South Sydney Weatherboard Buildings Survey Report, dated February 2004

The report was prepared in response to a perceived threat to weatherboard buildings in the south Sydney LGA. Over 300 weatherboard buildings were identified and of these, 270 were surveyed with many recommended for addition to the South Sydney LEP Schedule. Following amalgamation, the cottages are now within the City of Sydney LGA,

The report gives a good overview of the development of weatherboard and timber buildings in Sydney and the pattern of development in Sydney as larger landholdings and estates were subdivided for residential development including small-scale subdivision for workers' cottages. Timber was favoured by working class owners and builders as it was cheaper and easier to build.

Unfortunately, the use of timber has often led to substantial changes to, or demolition of, weatherboard cottages as the material was prone to white ant damage and rot and the houses were seen as less substantial than masonry buildings. They were also easier to alter.

7.2 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

The following schedule is a comparative study of selected weatherboard cottages in the Sydney Local Government Area (LGA) that are listed as heritage items or that are regarded as Contributory elements in a conservation area.

The cottages were chosen on the basis that they are listed items in the LEP or Contributory items in a conservation area and are comparable in scale (single storey), form, materials and detail. The schedule also provides the statements of significance for the properties to see what level of significance and intactness was the threshold for listing.

Common characteristic identified in the study below are

- Construction in the late Victorian period
- Modest scale and detail
- Double fronted form with hipped and gabled roofs
- Retention of the primary form and posted verandahs
- Some level of change and refurbishment internally
- Rear additions

The statements of significance often refer to the cottages as being **rare** and signalling the early development of the area.

7.3 46 CHISHOLM STREET

The cottage at 46 Chisholm Street has all of the characteristics noted in Section 7.2 above and remains readable as an early cottage in the conservation area.

It is rare being the only weatherboard cottage in the Chisholm Estate subdivision of the conservation area and is of a comparable standard and level of intactness to the properties noted in the Schedule.

7.4 934 ELIZABETH STREET, ZETLAND

Address	934 Elizabeth Street, Zetland
Date	Late Victorian
Description	A simple symmetrical single storey double fronted weatherboard cottage which has been vinyl clad. The building features timber double hung windows, posted verandah, cast iron lacework, 3 brick chimneys with corbelled collars and original chimney pots and an original 4 panelled front door.
History	Not known
Photos	
Plan	GROUND FLOOR
SHI	2420710
Significance	A good example of a late Victorian modest cottage and a rare example of an intact weatherboard cottage in the Zetland Estate which has retained its original form and detail.
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and extended to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its elevation (weatherboards overclad) and its posted verandah

7.5 117 HEREFORD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	117 Hereford Street, Forest Lodge
Date	c. 1876
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	posed verandah to the front
History	Built in 1876 and refurbished in 2008
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2427730
Significance	A rare surviving weatherboard workers' cottage within the Glebe/Forest Lodge area
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah
	Torrit and defail to its from elevation and its posted verandari

7.6 72 HORDERN STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	72 Hordern Street, Newtown (Rhoda Cottage)
Date	c.1876
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	posted verandah to the front
History	Part of O'Connell Town Village that was a subdivision of the land grant to William Bligh in 1803. First occupant recorded in 1879 was Joseph Collins
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431153
Significance	72 Hordern Street is of aesthetic and historical significance as a fine example of a single storey, simple, wide weatherboard cottage representing a class of dwellings now rare in Sydney generally. It is of aesthetic significance as part of a weatherboard group of buildings which contribute to the streetscape, with Nos. 74-76 Hordern Street adjacent
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised (2004) but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.7 54 JENNINGS STREET, ALEXANDRIA

Address	54 Jennings Street, Alexandria
Date	с. 1900
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	verandah to front
History	Part of the Waterloo Estate of William Hutchinson's 1823 land Grant
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431156
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a good example of a Federation
	detached working class cottage associated with the adjacent early local industries and the Eveleigh Railway Workshops. It has high integrity as part of a
	unique small group of weatherboard buildings in the area and for its own intact
	form and detailing
Notes	The cottage retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its
	posted verandah

7.8 46 LITTLE CLEVELAND STREET, REDFERN

Address	46 Little Cleveland Street, Redfern	
Date	c. early 1880s	
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with	
	posted verandah to the front	
History	Part of the Edward's Smith Hall's grant of 1822subdivided by Frederick Unwin in	
	1829. The house appears in the Sands Directory in 1884 occupied by Elizabeth	
	Patterson	
Photos		
Plan		
	Corrigation Corrigation Declaration 28:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 20:11 Be	
	STANLEY STREET	
SHI	2431155	
Significance	Of historical and aesthetic significance as an early working class cottage, rare due to its weatherboard construction and illustrating the variety of working class housing in the 19th century in this area. Due to its construction materials it appears to be one of the earliest houses in Little Cleveland Street	
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and appears to have a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah	

7.9 21 QUEEN STREET, BEACONSFIELD

Address	21 Queen Street, Beaconsfield (Beaufort)
Date	Post 1895
Description	Narrow, double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal
	roof with posted verandah to the front
History	Part of the Beaconsfield Estate
Photos	
SHI	2431157
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a relatively intact Federation weatherboard cottage which illustrates the variety of working class housing in this area, and demonstrates association between the provision of working class housing in the late 19th and early 20th century in this area and the proximity to industrial area operating at that time
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.10 43 UNION STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	43 Union Street, Newtown (Wonga)
Date	c. 1880s
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with
	later, posted verandah to the front
History	First recorded in the Sands Directory in 1882 occupied by sawyer, Alexander
	Storer
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431148
Significance	Wonga is of aesthetic significance as a late 19th century weatherboard cottage with elaborate details and finishes including a central tower section, a feature that rises from the edge of the front verandah about a metre with its own hipped end roof like a blind dormer. It has a well landscaped front garden and makes a positive contribution to the streetscape
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a single storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and later detail to its front elevation including its posted verandah

7.11 38 VICTORIA STREET, POTTS POINT

Address	38 Victoria Street, Potts Point (Overcliff)
Date	c. 1868
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with
	posted verandah to the front
History	Built by builder William Shoults and sold in 1869 to Master Mariner William Dawson
	Mills
Photos	
Plan	
	CER IN ANDROL BODOS B
	HB OLON HB OLO
SHI	2421379
Significance	Overcliff Cottage is a rare surviving example of a single storey weatherboard cottage with a pyramidal roof or double hipped roof and is the only known remaining timber cottage in Potts Point. It is unusual in having height ceilings, quality cedar joinery, an elegant and finely detailed timber staircase leading to a room in the roof with excellent view of the harbour and Woolloomooloo Bay in particular. The cottage is enhanced by its setting on the edge of an escarpment overlooking the harbour and aesthetically makes a very important contribution to the streetscape
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.12 39 MOREHEAD STREET, REDFERN

Address	39 Moorehead Street, Redfern
Date	c. early 1870s
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with posted verandah to the front
History	Built on part of the 1822 land grant to Edward Hall Smith that became part of the Cooper Estate part of which was later subdivided by James Ewart. In 1873 the house was occupied by painter Henry Joseph Merer
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2421009
Significance	39 Morehead Street is the last remaining timber house of a former group that was rare and significant at the State level as the only identified, surviving group of late 19th century timber, ridge line, working class rental houses built on small lots within a subdivision pattern that reflects the land management practises of the late 19th century 'urban manor' in a colonial environment. This significance is enhanced by the mid 20th century destruction of other comparable combinations of topographically responsive, urban vernacular built forms using predominantly timber fabric; 19th century Australian adapatations of English methods for providing cheap working class housing; clear links to the spread of industrialisation beyond the city boundaries in the 1870s and 1880s; and links to the pre-urban and pre-industrial rural land use of dairying. The Morehead Street timber houses group illustrated in its layers of fabric a continuum from rural to industrial to post-industrial cultural environments in the form of domestic housing unequalled elsewhere in the State. This building is also historically important as it forms part of the Cooper Street Conservation Area, an area which developed in the c1880s as a working class subdivision, as evidenced by the traditional grid patterns, small blocks and night soil lanes. The area is associated with Soloman Levey and Daniel Cooper, both emancipated convicts who became prominent businessmen forming the successful company Cooper and Levey. This timber dwelling is historically significant as it demonstrates the working class nature of the area through its construction and detail. The building has some landmark qualities being constructed on the property boundary and located on the prominent corner position of Morehead and Cooper Streets.
Notes	The cottage appears very intact and retains its gabled form and rear skillion and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.13 2 WOOD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	2 Wood Street, Forest Lodge (Alpha)
Date	c. 1880
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage on a sandstone base with gabled, corrugated metal roof with verandah to the front on later brick piers
History	Originally forming part of land purchased by John Wood in 1831, the property is Lot 28 in the subdivision of Wood's land undertaken in 1876. The cottage appears to have been erected around 1880 (the first in the street) for George Tumeth and stables were erected around 1885 for Johannes Theodore Joseph Brunning. Brunning named the cottage Alpha.
Photos	
Plan	Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor Image: Second Floor
SHI	Not listed – Contributory item in conservation area
Significance	2 Wood Street is a modest example of a single storey, late Victorian cottage in
	the Georgian vernacular style erected c. 1880 probably by the then owner of the property, George Tumuth and a brick stable built c. 1885 possibly by Johannes Brunning. The place has associations with John Wood (1811-1875) who erected the villa <i>Glenwood</i> on the early subdivision of the area and the Glebe that was set aside for the support of the Anglican Church in 1789. The house was the first built in the street is partly intact in form but has been altered internally and externally. The remnant brick stables are a rare, surviving example that demonstrates the early semi-commercial development of the area. The property is of high significance at a local level.
Source	JOHD HIS May 2015
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear yard but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation where the posted verandah has been reinstated (2015)

Relevant Information for Council

FILE:	X020345	DATE:	10 May 2019
то:	Lord Mayor and Councillors		
FROM:	Graham Jahn, Director City Planning, Dev	elopment ar	nd Transport
SUBJECT:	Information Relevant To Item 8.4 – Plannin Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Lo Amendment	v .	

Alternative Recommendation

It is resolved that:

- (A) Council approve the Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst, as shown at Attachment A to the subject report, for submission to the relevant local plan-making authority with a request for a Gateway Determination;
- (B) Council approve Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst for public authority consultation and public exhibition in accordance with any conditions imposed under the Gateway Determination;
- (C) Council seek authority from the relevant local plan making authority, to exercise the delegation of the relevant local plan making authority of all their functions under Section 3.31 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 to make the local environmental plan as amended by Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst; and
- (D) authority be delegated to the Chief Executive Officer to make any minor variations to Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst following receipt of the Gateway Determination.
- (E) Council note the information in 'Appendix A Weatherboard Cottages Comparative Study' prepared by John Oultram Heritage + Design at Attachment B to the Information Relevant To Item 8.4 Council on 13 May 2019 and incorporate it as an appendix to the supporting Heritage Assessment report of the 'Planning Proposal: 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst' at Attachment A to the subject report.

Additions shown in **bold italics**.

Purpose

To clarify a number of issues raised at the Transport, Heritage and Planning Committee meeting on Monday 6 May 2019.

Background

At the meeting of the Transport, Heritage and Planning Committee on 6 May 2019, further information was requested for Item 8.4 - Planning Proposal 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst - Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012.

The site has been the focus of redevelopment discussions since late 2017, when the property owner met City staff for a Pre-DA meeting. On that occasion, and subsequently, the City has consistently stated it did not support the proposed demolition of the existing cottage or subdivision of the site. On at least two occasions, City staff offered to work with the applicant on alternatives to wholesale demolition.

A chronology of the planning process for the proposed development is as follows:

- 12 December 2017 Pre-DA Meeting and site inspection
- 13 December 2017 the City advised that the demolition of the weatherboard cottage is not supported nor the subdivision of the land or the erection of two semi-detached dwellings. The pre-DA advice is provided at Attachment A.
- 30 May 2018 Development application lodged, D/2018/591, proposing the demolition of the existing single dwelling and subdivision of the site into two titles and the construction of two, two storey terraces.
- 28 August 2018 the City sought an interim heritage order from the Office of Environment and Heritage.
- 19 September 2018 Proponent requested to withdraw the development application as the City is likely to refuse the development application. Proponent did not withdraw the development application.
- 21 September 2018 The development application was refused under delegated authority.
- 16 November 2018 City engages John Oultram Heritage + Design to assess heritage significance.
- 12 December 2018 A section 8.2(1)(a) review of determination application was lodged.
- 21 December 2018 The Office of Environment and Heritage advised they were not pursuing an interim heritage order as development application had been refused, the property was not under threat, and there was time to complete an independent heritage assessment.
- 1 March 2019 Site inspection with Council staff and heritage consultant.

- 12 March 2019 Final heritage report notes that property should be considered for nomination for inclusion as a heritage item on the Sydney Local Environment Plan 2012
- 14 March 2019 Section 8.2(1)(a) application was refused.
- 18 March 2019 Applicant lodged Class 1 appeal with the Land and Environment Court

The appeal is set for a conciliation conference on 18 November 2019. Council filed its Statement of Facts and Contentions on 3 May 2019. Key contentions include:

- Heritage impact The application includes demolition of a contributory building, without demonstrating why the cottage is not capable of retention, nor does it justify demolition.
- Subdivision The proposed subdivision would result in two lots with widths of 3.047m and 3.007m, which is disproportionately narrow in the streetscape, disrupting the rhythm within the terrace row. The resulting dwellings will have internal widths of 2.6m with 0.8m hallways, which are not considered functional.
- Residential amenity The proposed dwellings provide less than 50 per cent of the required private open space, with no solar access to the rear private open space or either dwelling.
- Design excellence The proposal does not exhibit design excellence in relation to materials, streetscape, bulk and massing, residential amenity, subdivision pattern, building width and façade design.
- Public interest The proposal is detrimental to the conservation area and locality and submissions were also received objecting to the proposal on the grounds of heritage conservation, overdevelopment and poor internal amenity.

Comparative Analysis

Additional information has been provided by John Oultram Heritage + Design, further detailing the comparative analysis of weatherboard cottages within the City of Sydney. This information is provided in Attachment B and recommended to be incorporated into the Planning Proposal.

The cottage at 46 Chisholm Street has all of the characteristics of heritage listed weatherboard cottages in the City with a comparable degree of significance and intactness. It remains readable as an early cottage in the conservation area and is the only weatherboard cottage in the Chisholm Estate subdivision.

Weatherboard buildings are an important element of the city as they are amongst the oldest buildings in the City. They contribute a unique character to their streets and a diversity to city life. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.

While the weatherboard cottage at 46 Chisholm Street is flanked by two storey masonry terraces, the predominant building type of the Paddington Conservation Area, this does not mean the better heritage outcome is demolition and construction of two, two-storey terrace buildings.

Impact of Heritage Listing

The proposed heritage listing does not preclude appropriate development occurring at the site. For example, this may include the addition of a small wing at the rear, or an attic conversion. Staff have offered to work with the applicant on alternatives to the proposed wholesale demolition on at least two occasions, being in the pre-DA advice and when suggesting the development application be withdrawn or be refused.

The proposed listing of the weatherboard cottage is a separate matter to the development application matter to be heard by the Land and Environment court.

Memo from Graham Jahn AM, Director City Planning, Development and Transport

Prepared by: Matt Devine, Senior Specialist Planner (Heritage)

Attachments

Attachment A. Pre-DA Advice - Redacted Email dated 13 December 2017.

Attachment B. Heritage Assessment - Appendix- Weatherboard Cottage Comparative Analysis.

Approved

GRAHAM JAHN AM, DIRECTOR CITY PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORT

Attachment A

Pre-DA advice - redacted email dated 13 December 2017

From:	
То:	
Cc:	;
Subject:	RE: Pre-DA submission - 46 Chisholm Street Darlinghurst
Date:	Wednesday, 13 December 2017 3:46:00 PM
Attachments:	image001.jpg

Dear

Thank you for organising and meeting with the City yesterday at your clients home at 46 Chisolm Street, Darlinghurst.

As discussed with you on site yesterday, the City has had the opportunity now after the site visit to further review the preliminary documentation provided.

The proposal for the demolition of the weatherboard cottage is not supported and, in turn, nor is the subdivision of the land or the erection of two semi-detached dwellings.

Notwithstanding, the City would like to work with you and your client in regards to the scope of change that may be possible. It may be possible, for instance, to go into the roof space to create more habitable area via a rear roof extention and potentially new dormer(s) to the front. It may also be possible to move the ground floor back wall marginally.

I trust that this information is of assistance.

Regards,



Hi and

A pre-DA request is attached.

The proposal is for:

- demolition of the existing single storey weather board cottage;
- subdivide the land into 2 even Torrens title lots; and
- erect 2 to 2-storey semi-detached dwelling houses.

Draft plans prepared by	dated 22/11/17, Draft Heritage Impact
Statement (HIS) prepared by	dated 25/11/17 and a Review are
provided attached.	

The new housing proposed is on small lots and our view is that the 'fine grain' and form or this Conservaiton is actually reinforced by the proposal. We are aware that the City of Sydney officers have taken quite an enlightened view in respect to small lot housing such as in the case of the recommendation for (see DA) and we are hoping for a similarly enlightened view.

Let's talk, the client and architect would like to meet at your earliest convenience and please call if you want to do a full site visit to organise.

Regards

	1	
Postal Address:		
Office Address: Phone: +61.2	Fax: +61.2	
Please consider the	e environment before printing this e-mail.	
-		

Disclaimer: This e-mail and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the following recipient(s):

,council@cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au,

If you are not any of the named addressee mentioned above; you should not disseminate, distribute, copy or alter this e-mail. Please notify Philip Bull immediately by replying to this e-mail if you have received this e-mail by mistake and delete this e-mail from your system.

Any views or opinions presented in this e-mail are solely those of the author and might not represent those of BBC Consulting Planners. BBC Consulting Planners accepts no liability for the content of this email, or for the consequences of any actions taken on the basis of the information provided, unless that information is subsequently confirmed in writing.

Warning: Although Planners has taken reasonable precautions to ensure no viruses are present in this email, Planners cannot accept responsibility for any loss or damage arising from the use of this email or attachments.

The original e-mail was sent on 1/12/2017 at 11:21 AM

Attachment B

Heritage Assessment - Appendix - 46 Chisholm Street, Darlinghurst

7.0 APPENDIX A – WEATHERBOARD COTTAGES COMPARATIVE STUDY

7.1 PREAMBLE

Weatherboard buildings are an important element of the city as they are amongst the oldest residential buildings in the City. They contribute a unique character to their streets and bring diversity to city life. They also often signal the early development of Sydney's inner suburbs as areas were subdivided for residential development and also the common building methods of the time. However, they are becoming increasingly rare and have been under threat of demolition.

A heritage study of weatherboard cottages in the South Sydney LGA was prepared in 2004:

Musecape Pty Limited (in association), Draft South Sydney Weatherboard Buildings Survey Report, dated February 2004

The report was prepared in response to a perceived threat to weatherboard buildings in the south Sydney LGA. Over 300 weatherboard buildings were identified and of these, 270 were surveyed with many recommended for addition to the South Sydney LEP Schedule. Following amalgamation, the cottages are now within the City of Sydney LGA,

The report gives a good overview of the development of weatherboard and timber buildings in Sydney and the pattern of development in Sydney as larger landholdings and estates were subdivided for residential development including small-scale subdivision for workers' cottages. Timber was favoured by working class owners and builders as it was cheaper and easier to build.

Unfortunately, the use of timber has often led to substantial changes to, or demolition of, weatherboard cottages as the material was prone to white ant damage and rot and the houses were seen as less substantial than masonry buildings. They were also easier to alter.

7.2 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

The following schedule is a comparative study of selected weatherboard cottages in the Sydney Local Government Area (LGA) that are listed as heritage items or that are regarded as Contributory elements in a conservation area.

The cottages were chosen on the basis that they are listed items in the LEP or Contributory items in a conservation area and are comparable in scale (single storey), form, materials and detail. The schedule also provides the statements of significance for the properties to see what level of significance and intactness was the threshold for listing.

Common characteristic identified in the study below are

- Construction in the late Victorian period
- Modest scale and detail
- Double fronted form with hipped and gabled roofs
- Retention of the primary form and posted verandahs
- Some level of change and refurbishment internally
- Rear additions

The statements of significance often refer to the cottages as being **rare** and signalling the early development of the area.

7.3 46 CHISHOLM STREET

The cottage at 46 Chisholm Street has all of the characteristics noted in Section 7.2 above and remains readable as an early cottage in the conservation area.

It is rare being the only weatherboard cottage in the Chisholm Estate subdivision of the conservation area and is of a comparable standard and level of intactness to the properties noted in the Schedule.

7.4 934 ELIZABETH STREET, ZETLAND

Address	934 Elizabeth Street, Zetland
Date	Late Victorian
Description	A simple symmetrical single storey double fronted weatherboard cottage which has been vinyl clad. The building features timber double hung windows, posted verandah, cast iron lacework, 3 brick chimneys with corbelled collars and original chimney pots and an original 4 panelled front door.
History	Not known
Photos	
Plan	GROUND FLOOR
SHI	2420710
Significance	A good example of a late Victorian modest cottage and a rare example of an intact weatherboard cottage in the Zetland Estate which has retained its original form and detail.
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and extended to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its elevation (weatherboards overclad) and its posted verandah

7.5 117 HEREFORD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	117 Hereford Street, Forest Lodge
Date	c. 1876
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	posed verandah to the front
History	Built in 1876 and refurbished in 2008
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2427730
Significance	A rare surviving weatherboard workers' cottage within the Glebe/Forest Lodge area
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah
	Torrit and defail to its from elevation and its posted verandari

7.6 72 HORDERN STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	72 Hordern Street, Newtown (Rhoda Cottage)
Date	c.1876
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	posted verandah to the front
History	Part of O'Connell Town Village that was a subdivision of the land grant to William Bligh in 1803. First occupant recorded in 1879 was Joseph Collins
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431153
Significance	72 Hordern Street is of aesthetic and historical significance as a fine example of a single storey, simple, wide weatherboard cottage representing a class of dwellings now rare in Sydney generally. It is of aesthetic significance as part of a weatherboard group of buildings which contribute to the streetscape, with Nos. 74-76 Hordern Street adjacent
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised (2004) but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.7 54 JENNINGS STREET, ALEXANDRIA

Address	54 Jennings Street, Alexandria
Date	с. 1900
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal roof with
	verandah to front
History	Part of the Waterloo Estate of William Hutchinson's 1823 land Grant
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431156
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a good example of a Federation
	detached working class cottage associated with the adjacent early local industries and the Eveleigh Railway Workshops. It has high integrity as part of a
	unique small group of weatherboard buildings in the area and for its own intact
	form and detailing
Notes	The cottage retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its
	posted verandah

7.8 46 LITTLE CLEVELAND STREET, REDFERN

Address	46 Little Cleveland Street, Redfern	
Date	c. early 1880s	
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with	
	posted verandah to the front	
History	Part of the Edward's Smith Hall's grant of 1822subdivided by Frederick Unwin in	
	1829. The house appears in the Sands Directory in 1884 occupied by Elizabeth	
	Patterson	
Photos		
Plan		
	Corrigation Corrigation Declaration 28:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 29:11 Bedroom 20:11 Be	
	STANLEY STREET	
SHI	2431155	
Significance	Of historical and aesthetic significance as an early working class cottage, rare due to its weatherboard construction and illustrating the variety of working class housing in the 19th century in this area. Due to its construction materials it appears to be one of the earliest houses in Little Cleveland Street	
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and appears to have a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah	

7.9 21 QUEEN STREET, BEACONSFIELD

Address	21 Queen Street, Beaconsfield (Beaufort)
Date	Post 1895
Description	Narrow, double fronted weatherboard cottage with gabled, corrugated metal
	roof with posted verandah to the front
History	Part of the Beaconsfield Estate
Photos	
SHI	2431157
Significance	Of aesthetic and historical significance as a relatively intact Federation weatherboard cottage which illustrates the variety of working class housing in this area, and demonstrates association between the provision of working class housing in the late 19th and early 20th century in this area and the proximity to industrial area operating at that time
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.10 43 UNION STREET, NEWTOWN

Address	43 Union Street, Newtown (Wonga)
Date	c. 1880s
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with
	later, posted verandah to the front
History	First recorded in the Sands Directory in 1882 occupied by sawyer, Alexander
	Storer
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2431148
Significance	Wonga is of aesthetic significance as a late 19th century weatherboard cottage with elaborate details and finishes including a central tower section, a feature that rises from the edge of the front verandah about a metre with its own hipped end roof like a blind dormer. It has a well landscaped front garden and makes a positive contribution to the streetscape
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a single storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and later detail to its front elevation including its posted verandah

7.11 38 VICTORIA STREET, POTTS POINT

Address	38 Victoria Street, Potts Point (Overcliff)
Date	c. 1868
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with posted verandah to the front
History	Built by builder William Shoults and sold in 1869 to Master Mariner William Dawson Mills
Photos	
Plan	
	Chair Invasion
	High Con- High Con-
SHI	2421379
Significance	Overcliff Cottage is a rare surviving example of a single storey weatherboard cottage with a pyramidal roof or double hipped roof and is the only known remaining timber cottage in Potts Point. It is unusual in having height ceilings, quality cedar joinery, an elegant and finely detailed timber staircase leading to a room in the roof with excellent view of the harbour and Woolloomooloo Bay in particular. The cottage is enhanced by its setting on the edge of an escarpment overlooking the harbour and aesthetically makes a very important contribution to the streetscape
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.12 39 MOREHEAD STREET, REDFERN

Address	39 Moorehead Street, Redfern
Date	c. early 1870s
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage with hipped, corrugated metal roof with posted verandah to the front
History	Built on part of the 1822 land grant to Edward Hall Smith that became part of the Cooper Estate part of which was later subdivided by James Ewart. In 1873 the house was occupied by painter Henry Joseph Merer
Photos	
Plan	
SHI	2421009
Significance	39 Morehead Street is the last remaining timber house of a former group that was rare and significant at the State level as the only identified, surviving group of late 19th century timber, ridge line, working class rental houses built on small lots within a subdivision pattern that reflects the land management practises of the late 19th century 'urban manor' in a colonial environment. This significance is enhanced by the mid 20th century destruction of other comparable combinations of topographically responsive, urban vernacular built forms using predominantly timber fabric; 19th century Australian adapatations of English methods for providing cheap working class housing; clear links to the spread of industrialisation beyond the city boundaries in the 1870s and 1880s; and links to the pre-urban and pre-industrial rural land use of dairying. The Morehead Street timber houses group illustrated in its layers of fabric a continuum from rural to industrial to post-industrial cultural environments in the form of domestic housing unequalled elsewhere in the State. This building is also historically important as it forms part of the Cooper Street Conservation Area, an area which developed in the c1880s as a working class subdivision, as evidenced by the traditional grid patterns, small blocks and night soil lanes. The area is associated with Soloman Levey and Daniel Cooper, both emancipated convicts who became prominent businessmen forming the successful company Cooper and Levey. This timber dwelling is historically significant as it demonstrates the working class nature of the area through its construction and detail. The building is aesthetically important as a rare surviving example of a timber dwelling Victorian Georgian style. The building is typical of this style of architecture being small in scale and uncasuming in detail. It has a steep pitched roof and close eaves on all sides, characteristic of this period. The building has some landmark qualities being constructed on the property boundary and located on th
Notes	The cottage appears very intact and retains its gabled form and rear skillion and detail to its front elevation and its posted verandah

7.13 2 WOOD STREET, FOREST LODGE

Address	2 Wood Street, Forest Lodge (Alpha)
Date	c. 1880
Description	Double fronted weatherboard cottage on a sandstone base with gabled, corrugated metal roof with verandah to the front on later brick piers
History	Originally forming part of land purchased by John Wood in 1831, the property is Lot 28 in the subdivision of Wood's land undertaken in 1876. The cottage appears to have been erected around 1880 (the first in the street) for George Tumeth and stables were erected around 1885 for Johannes Theodore Joseph Brunning. Brunning named the cottage Alpha.
Photos	
Plan	Image: State of the state
SHI	Not listed – Contributory item in conservation area
Significance	2 Wood Street is a modest example of a single storey, late Victorian cottage in
	the Georgian vernacular style erected c. 1880 probably by the then owner of the property, George Tumuth and a brick stable built c. 1885 possibly by Johannes Brunning. The place has associations with John Wood (1811-1875) who erected the villa Glenwood on the early subdivision of the area and the Glebe that was set aside for the support of the Anglican Church in 1789. The house was the first built in the street is partly intact in form but has been altered internally and externally. The remnant brick stables are a rare, surviving example that demonstrates the early semi-commercial development of the area. The property is of high significance at a local level.
Source	JOHD HIS May 2015
Notes	The cottage has been altered and modernised internally and has a two storey extension to the rear yard but retains its original form and detail to its front elevation where the posted verandah has been reinstated (2015)